

Aquaculture Symposium

Tuesday November 27, 2008

**Holiday Inn-National Airport
Shenandoah Ballroom
2650 Jefferson Davis Highway
Arlington, VA**

Aquaculture Symposium: Fish Meal/Oil, Open Nets, Poster Sessions

8:00 am – 4:00 pm

Presenters:

- Md. Shah Alam, University of North Carolina Wilmington, Center for Marine Research
- Torbjorn Asgard, Akvaforsk, Norway
- Craig Browdy, Marine Resources Institute, South Carolina Dept of Natural Resources
- Steven Craig, VA/MD Regional College of Veterinary Medicine, VA Tech
- Brad Hicks, Chair, Pacific Organic Seafood Association, BC, Canada
- Jonathan Shepherd, International Fishmeal and Fish Oil Organization
- Sandra Bravo, Aquaculture Institute, Universidad Austral de Chile
- Kenneth Brooks, Aquatic Environmental Sciences, Washington
- Andrea Kavanagh, Director, Pure Salmon Campaign
- Martin Krkosek, Centre for Mathematical Biology, University of Alberta, Canada
- George Leonard, Monterey Bay Aquarium, Center for the Future of Oceans
- Neil Sims, Kona Blue

Poster Sessions 4:00 pm

Adjourn: 5:30 pm

NOSB Meeting Summary of Minutes

Wednesday November 28, 2007

Taken by Bea James, NOSB Secretary

**Holiday Inn-National Airport
Shenandoah Ballroom
2650 Jefferson Davis Highway
Arlington, VA**

NOSB Attendance:

Chair: Andrea Caroe, Vice Chair: Julie Weisman, Secretary, Bea James, Gerald Davis, Rigoberto Delgado, Steve DeMuri, Tina Ellor, Kevin Engelbert, Daniel Giacomini, Jennifer Hall, Katrina Heinze, Bea James, Hubert Karreman, Tracy Miedema, Jeffrey Moyer, Joseph Smillie, Julie Weisman

NOP Attendance:

Barbara C. Robinson, Mark A. Bradley, Katherine Benham, Valerie Frances
Robert Pooler, Jonathan Melvin, Richard Mathews, Valerie Schmale

Call to Order AC 8:07 am

- Approval of agenda
 - Move to accept agenda JS
 - 2nd JW with change to agenda re. handling
 - JS change multi site reco to discussion not recommendation
 - DG speaker for today not on agenda
 - AC accept agenda with changes
- Wrap up Aquaculture symposium
 - AC-overview and summary of meeting
- AC-Purpose of meeting, authority of board with public comment
 - Reading of Statute in OFPA Sec. 2119 7 USC 6518 NOSB
- Announcements
 - None
- Introductions
 - HK, KE, JM, JH, RD, DG, JW, AC, BJ, JS, KH, TM, SD, GD, TE, NOP staff
- Secretaries Report
 - BJ Motion to Accept March 2007 Meeting Transcripts (BJ noted that the transcripts have errors that need to be corrected) 2nd JS
 - BJ Motion to accept summary of minutes and votes from March 2007 meeting. 2nd SD, Abstain HK & TinaE
- NOP Update
 - BR- The NOP and the NOSB received a letter alleging violations about a member of the Board. This letter was written by 2 private individuals that were former members of the board. NOSB are representatives of the board, and are not federal employees. Nothing has been violated. The alleged violation of the NOSB Policy & Procedures Manual is a violation of NOSB Policy, and not a USDA Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA) or NOP violation. Each of you has been appointed because of the particular expertise of the industry that you represent, and because of your expertise, you all have a particular conflict of interest. To recuse yourself from the discussions that are going on makes it so that you can not express your particular expertise. The Secretary appointed you. The Secretary supports all 15 of you. And you are not getting off the board this easily. And that is the end of the matter.
 - Budget-Next year we will only work on what are known as FOIAs, Freedom of Information Act Requests. Unless we do something different. Because

that's pretty much what we are doing now, Freedom of Information Act requests. As answer to that, we are developing e-NOP.

- e-NOP- Electronic - National Organic Program. Where everything that can be published will be published for anyone to view. Click on a certifying agents name and you will see the license that grants them to do businesses, audits, find all appeals and appeal decisions, and eventually all noncompliances and all decisions issued by NOP. The goal is that when 100 people call in they all get the same information. We are not there yet but we will get there. We have limited resources. There will be accountability and it will be a painful burden to us, but if we don't do this, the program will be paralyzed by FOIA. We will not be able to have more than 1 meeting because we will be bogged down with FOIA's. Staff is spending more time on FOIA's than anything else and part of that is due to the NOP. The public has every right to know what goes on in the program.
- Moving ahead with equivalence discussions with Canada. We are waiting for the Office of the United States Trade Representative (USTR), which is the White House Office to give us a green light on whether we can take the next step and move ahead with formal discussions with Canada. As you may know their standards will come into effect in December of 2008. Equivalence is difficult to achieve with the National Organic Program (NOP) Regulations. Canada has problems with two of our materials, Chilean nitrate and Potassium Bicarbonate. And of course they have antibiotics. Much to discuss.
- Dockets. Signed off on Sunset '08, Sunset '11; and no sunset until then because no materials were added. Sucrose octanoate esters is done. HK: your livestock meds, I signed off on the final rule just before I came down. All of these dockets will be published next week. So Merry Christmas!
- Deputy Undersecretary, Dr. Burton Eller, might show up today.

Break 8:52 am

Resume: 9:03

- AC-Introduction of Deputy Undersecretary of Marketing and Regulatory Programs: Dr. Burton Eller. I have a lot of catching up to do with industry and have recently been involved with AMS on nomenclature for grass-fed and naturally raised. Grew up on organic agriculture without really knowing it and glad to see all of the people here that are involved in advancing and promoting the organic industry. Congratulations to AC. On behalf of the Secretary and Undersecretary Knight, we thank the NOSB. You are an example of public private partnership and leadership philosophy that USDA has made strides with.
- USDA has been extremely involved in trying to change farm policy with listening sessions held around the country, and there are a number of changes in the new farm bill. It shows support and new funding for organic data. Signing of the farm bill should occur within 3 weeks or by Easter. Farm bill is very complicated and we will have to cherry pick various extensions. Expanded resources for organic research. New and improved research for varieties of seed more suitable to organics. Organic

certification cost share program will be expanding to all states and with increased resources. And there is increased funding for the NOP. USDA and Congress cannot ignore the need with the 15-20% annual growth for compliance and enforcement activities. This program is the fastest growing program that we have.

- We have a section of the farm bill now for specialty crops – Title X – your industry has contributed to that. We need a new farm bill that serves both farmers and consumers. AMS recently held a National Farmers Market Summit in Baltimore – part of the effort to support the niche markets. Direct local producer to consumer will be strong and will maintain local farms and open space. One thing that is going to rival the growth of the organic market is the locally grown market.
- Another way USDA might be able to help niche farming is with the National Animal ID program, the NAIS (National Animal Identification System). The Secretary has asked them that they change it from mandatory to voluntary, and that they put the system together, make all three legs of the milk stool work: premise registration, animal identification, and animal tracing in case of a disaster. It is working and so that when the producer wants it - if the producer wants it, it is ready for them. It is working as tags for ears. It's probably one of the best management tools that you could ever imagine. Our job is to protect people and animals and lives and economies and businesses and farms. This technology is already used in the shipping industry. This can also be used to support an export certification program.
- He is also interested in the reports on animal welfare being presented today and he would like copies of them. Thanks for having him here today.

- NOP Update from BR- a little more information 9:23
 - Docket update on pasture. Optimistic that it will be completed soon. OMB (office of management business) will receive the rule and they will apply budget-tough sell. BR will work with them directly. Have clearance on the pasture rule, with attorneys. Gotten them satisfied on the actual language of the regulation. And what, all we're working out now, is ancillary documents: the impact on small producers, sort of the cost benefit analysis of this, and the paperwork burden, and I'm very optimistic that we're going to get this done shortly.
 - KE-Origin of livestock where are we? BR drafted and it is being worked on? She has one person to work on these regulations and the order of priority was materials, then pasture and then origin of livestock.

Public Comment 9:28

- AC- Reading Rules of Engagement for public comment from the PPM

- Urvashi Rangan, Consumer Union-Aquaculture
 - Questions: TM, JS, BJ

- Carrie Brownstein, Whole Foods Market, Aquaculture
 - Questions: JS, AC

- Jim Pierce, WI Aquaculture Association

- Joe Mendelson, Center for Food Safety
 - Questions: AC, DG
- Patty Lovera, Food and Water Watch
 - Questions: HK, RD, KE, HK
- Cory Peet, Monterey Bay Aquarium
 - Questions: HK, BR, HK
- Alejandro Buschman, NY Medical College
 - Questions: JM, RD, HK, GD
- Becky Goldberg, Environmental Defense
 - Questions: GD, JS, AC
- Rhonda Belluso, Pure Salmon Campaign
- Sebastian Belle, Maine Aquaculture Association
 - Questions: SD, BJ
- Barton Seaver, Hook Restaurant
 - Questions: KH, BJ, KE
- Rob Mayo University of Idaho
 - Questions: DG
- Earnest Papadoylianios, Neptune Industries
 - Questions: JS, JM, DG, GD, RD, HK, BR
- Earnest Papadoylianios, Neptune Industries
 - Questions: SD
- Brad Hicks, Pacific Organic Standard Association
 - Questions; KE, JS
- Spencer Evans, Creative Salmon
 - Questions: JS, HK, SD, GD
- George Lockwood, Aquaculture Working Group
- David Guggenheim, One Planet One Ocean
 - Questions; KE
- Mike Picchietti, Regal Springs Tilapia
 - Questions: JS

- Alice Chiu, Stanford University
- Dick Martin, Blackpearl Seafood
- Mark Kastel, Cornucopia
 - Questions: AC
- Harriet Behar, MOSES
 - Questions: JS, JH

Lunch Break 1:00

Resume 1:42

- Presentation Animal Health and Welfare: Results from a Cooperative State Research, Education and Extension funded Study. Kathleen a Merrigan, PhD and Willie Lockweetz PhD Agriculture, Food and Environment Program, Tufts University
- Presentation Margaret Wittenberg, Global VP Quality Standards and Public Affairs, Whole Foods A Tiered 5 Step Animal Welfare Rating System

Public Comment 2:40 pm

- Jim Pierce Organic Valley CROP Cooperative
 - Questions: JW
- Tom Hutchenson, Organic Trade Association
 - Questions: TM
- Alex Moreno OCIA International
- DeEtta Bilek President OCIA International
 - Questions: JH
- Michael Sligh RAFI-USA
- Garry Lean IOIA Chair
- Catherine Cash, IOIA BOD Member
- Katherine DeMatteo, IFOAM
 - Questions: TM
- Linan Hoodes, National Campaign
 - Questions: BJ
- Kimberly Easson, Trans Fair USA

- John Foster, Earthbound Farms
 - Questions: JS, TM
- Sue Baird, QAI
- Pat Kane, ACA on behalf of NASOP
- Gwendolyn Wyard, Oregon Tilth
 - Questions: JS
- Tiffanie Hudson Labbe, Oregon Tilth
 - Questions: Bj, JM, KH, TM, KH
- Jake Lewin, CCOF
 - Questions: BJ, KH
- Sam Welsch, One Cert
 - Questions: AC, BJ
- Sam Welsch, One Cert
 - Questions: BJ, KE
- Maury Johnson, Blue River Hybrids
 - Questions: GD, BJ, TM
- Marty Mesh, Florida Organic Growers
- Emily Brown Rosen, PCO
 - Questions: HK, GD, TM, DG
- Grace Marroquin, Marroquin International
 - Questions: JS, GD, DG
- Grace Gershuny GAIA Services
 - Questions: KH
- Brian Baker, OMRI
 - Questions: KH, GD, DG
- Rose Koenig, former NOSB member
- Judy Thompson, PQ CorpDatnoff
- Lawrence Datrioff, University of Florida
 - Questions, JS, AC

- Lawrence Marais, Monterey Ag Resources
 - Questions: RD
- Jay Irvine Monterey Ag Resources
- Mitch Johnson, Intervet
- Dave Martinelli, Coleman Natural Foods and Methionine Task Force
 - Questions: KE, HK, DG
- Kelly Shea, White Wave Foods
- Liana Hoodes (proxy for Jim Riddle) (proxy for Joyce Ford)
- **Recess 7:10 pm**

NOSB Meeting Summary of Minutes
Thursday November 29, 2007
Taken by Bea James, NOSB Secretary

NOSB Attendance:

Chair: Andrea Caroe, Vice Chair: Julie Weisman, Secretary, Bea James,
 Gerald Davis, Rigoberto Delgado, Steve DeMuri, Tina Ellor, Kevin Engelbert, Daniel
 Giacomini, Jennifer Hall, Katrina Heinze, Bea James, Hubert Karreman, Tracy Miedema,
 Joseph Smillie, Julie Weisman
 Jeff Moyer joined at 5:30 pm

NOP Attendance:

Barbara C. Robinson, Mark A. Bradley, Katherine Benham, Valerie Frances
 Robert Pooler, Jonathan Melvin, Richard Mathews, Valerie Schmale

Call to order 8:12

NOSB Committee Presentations and Discussions

- Policy-RD
 - Revisions of Board Policy Manual
 - Update NOSB New Member Guide
 - Collaboration with NOP on NOSB recommendations history
 - Questions: BJ, AC, KrE, GD, TM
- Joint Policy Development, Crops, and Livestock Committees-RD
 - Guidance on the certification of Operations Involved in Crops Research
 - Guidance on Temporary Research Variance
 - Questions: GD, AC, KE

- Materials Committee-DG
Materials Review Process-DG
Questions: HK, BR, GD, Kim D., BR, Rose K., KE, HK, AC, BR, BJ, DG, GD

Break 9:35

Resume: 8:52

- Materials cont. DG
National List: Clarification of Definition of Materials
Questions: KH, BJ, DG, JW, Rose K., HK, AC
- Handling Committee JW
Pet Food Standards
Questions; HK, Br, AC, VF, BJ
Grape Seed Extract
Question; AC, JS, DG, HK, BJ, JS, TnE, TM, HK, JW, DG, Jake L.
- Gellan Gum
Motion to reconsider-move Jennifer Hall 2nd TM
Favor: 13 No 1 Absent: 1
Pass for reconsideration
Questions: JW, BJ, KH, HK, JS
- Sunset Materials
605 a Agar-agar, animal enzymes, carrageenan, glucono-delta-lactone, calcium sulfate
605 b cellulose
Discussion for tartaric acid (not to vote on due to not being on the agenda)
Questions: KH, HK, BR, HK, AC

Lunch 11:45

Resume 12:55pm

- Crops Committee GD
Petitioned Materials-potassium Silicate
Sodium Carbonate Peroxyhydrate (request from the board for the recommendation form to be filled out again and presented to the Board again)
Sodium Ferric Hydroxy EDTA
Sunset Materials-calcium chloride, copper sulfate, ozone gas, peracetic acid, EPA list
3 inerts in passive pheromone dispensers
- CAC Committee Recommendations-JS
Standardized Certificates-JH
CA Guidance for Certifiers-BJ
Multi-Site Operation Certification-TM, BJ

Break 2:57

Resume: 3:18

- Continue CAC Committee Recommendations-JS
Multi-site Recommendation-TM
Minority Opinion BJ
- Livestock Committee-HK
Aquaculture fish feed and net pens
Aquaculture working group supplement to interim final report on Bivalve

Public Comment

- Peter VanWhite, Scientific Association-Aquaculture
 - Questions: AC, HK
- Rob Everts, Equal Exchange-Multisite
 - Questions: HK, BJ, RD, DG, JS
- Joe Dickson, Whole Foods Market
 - Questions: BJ, DG, TM, HK
- Will Fantel, Cornucopia Institute
 - Questions: BJ, DG
- Steve Pierce, Ribus
 - Questions: AC, TM, JW, AC, GD, BR
- Tom Hutchenson, OTA
- Kristen Knox, BioSafe Systems
- Gwyndelon Wyard, Oregon Tilth
- Consuelo Allen, Whole Foods Market
- MJ Martial, Flavors and Manufacturers Association
- Cheryl Van Dyne, CPKelco
- Barbara Chinn CP Kelco
- Richard Green CP Kelco
- Mark Cool, Seeds of Change
 - Questions: AC, SD, HK, JM
- Steve Fournier, Pet Guard

- Dave Carter,
 - Questions: AC

- Nicole Dehne, Vermont Organic Farmers

- Eunice Cuirle, Marinalg International

- Rich Theuer, OMRI Review Panel
 - Questions: HK, GD

- Mark Kastel, Cornocopia

Recess 7:15 pm

NOSB Meeting Summary of Minutes Friday November 30, 2007

Taken by Bea James, NOSB Secretary

NOSB Attendance:

Chair: Andrea Caroe, Vice Chair: Julie Weisman, Secretary, Bea James, Gerald Davis, Rigoberto Delgado, Steve DeMuri, Tina Ellor, Kevin Engelbert, Daniel Giacomini, Jennifer Hall, Katrina Heinze, Bea James, Hubert Karreman, Tracy Miedema, Joseph Smillie, Julie Weisman
Jeff Moyer joined at 5:30 pm

NOP Attendance:

Barbara C. Robinson, Mark A. Bradley, Katherine Benham, Valerie Frances Robert Pooler, Jonathan Melvin, Richard Mathews, Valerie Schmale

Call to order AC 8:11am

Public Comments

- Kim Dietz, Smucker Quality International
Questions: BR

- Kelly Shea, Horizon/White Wave Foods

- Steven Walker, MOSA

- Jackie Von Zudin, MOSA

- Leslie Zuck, PCO

- Grace Marroquin, Marroquin International

- Sue Baird, QAI
- Katerine DeMatteo, Individual
Questions: JM, BJ
- Break: 9:10
- Resume: 9:25
- Emily Brown Rosen, Pennsylvania Certified Organic
Questions: BJ, HK, KH, JS, KvE
- Emily Brown Rosen, Pennsylvania Certified Organic (104.20 Reg
supplement) Questions: AC, BR, AC
- Steffen Scheide
- Patti Bursten Denutsch
- Lynn Coody
Questions: KH, BJ, RD, HK, KvE, AC, TM
Barbara Robinson, USDA NOP
- Nominations for secretary: BJ nominated: Katrina Heinze. HK 2nd.
KH elected new secretary
- Nominations for Vice Chair: HK nominated JM, TE 2nd. JS nominated JW, SD 2nd.
TM nominated DG, HK 2nd.
JM elected new VC
- Nominations for Chair: KE nominated RD, HK 2nd. Nominations for chair HK
TM nominated GD, DG 2nd.
Rigo elected new Chair
- CONGRATULATIONS TO ALL. Applauds.

Crops Work Plan-GD

Petitions as they arise
Hydroponics
CA of organic seed in collaborations with the CACC
Mushroom recommendation review

CAC Committee-JS

Multi-site recommendation
Joint recommendation on Seed with Crops and livestock
Pasteurized almonds – BR to review with Lloyd Day

Handling Committee-JW

Continued work on definition of materials

Materials for sunset review- tartaric acid.

Review of petitioned materials-3 recent petitions, calcium from seaweed
clucosium peroxide, yeast

605. calcium from seaweed, glucosamine hydroxide, Propionic acid

606-deferral of low methoxy pectin, but needs review

For 606 - 15 items. Chinese thistle daisy, black paper, camu camu extract powder,
caramel color—chickory root extract, Codonopsis root extract, ginger root extract,
jojoba fruit extract, marsala cooking wine, peony root extract, polygala root extract,
poria fungus extract, Rehmannia root extract, sherry cooking wine, and tangerine peel
extract

Review of pet food standards w/LS as needed

Flavor guidance

Food contact substances

Fortification of food

Materials Committee-DG

Tracking of petitions of sunset items

Clarification of yeast

Clarification of Definitions of National List materials. Non ag definition

Access to information only contained in the CBI petitions regarding commercial
availability

Policy Committee - RD

Complete data base of recommendations

New Member Guide updates-creation of link to final recommendations

Include list of common tec sources used by committees for review process

Updates to PPM overview of flow of document

Livestock Committee - HK

Continue aquaculture: net pens and fish meal, fish oil, compost for ponds and aquatic
edible plants, and bivalve mollusks.

2 materials: Fenbendazole, a parasiticide and methonine

Poultry-outdoor access

Animal care and welfare

Bee's

- Many thanks and appreciations to outgoing Chair AC

Move to adjourn: BJ, 2nd JM

Adjourn 3:45 pm