

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting Notes  
Tuesday, January 6, 2015 3:00pm ET**

**Attending:** Tracy Favre, Chair (TF), Joe Dickson, Vice Chair (JD), Colehour Bondera (CBo), Calvin Walker (CW), Francis Thicke (FT), Jean Richardson (JR), Jay Feldman (JFe) - sitting in, Ashley Swaffar (AS), 2015 NOSB member - sitting in, Paula Daniels (PD), 2015 NOSB member - sitting in in

**Absent:** Mac Stone (MS), Wendy Fulwider (WF)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

**Work Agenda**

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Methionine in organic poultry feed (MET)-petitioned	205.603	MS	<a href="#">2011 TR</a>	TR received 11 15 11		Proposal Spr 2015
<a href="#">Acidified Sodium chlorite (ASC) Petition Addendum #1 Petition Addendum #2</a>	205.603 (a)(b)	JD/FT	<a href="#">2008 TR</a> <a href="#">2013 TR</a>	Petition sent to LS 06 12 12. Petition found sufficient 09 18. TR requested on 09 18 12. TR sent to LS 05 08 13. TR found suff 07 30 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled. Spring 2014 sent back to LS.		Proposal Spr 2015
<a href="#">Aluminum Sulfate (PDF)</a>	205.603	JR	Y	The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015.		Proposal Spr 2015?
<a href="#">Sodium Bisulfate</a>	205.603	JR	Y	Petition sent to LS 05 27 14. Q's for petitioner/TR request due 07 28 14. TR request sent to NOP 08 06 14. TR expected Jan 2015.		TBD
<a href="#">Zinc Sulfate</a>	205.603	TF	Y	Petition sent to LS 06 16 14. Q's for petitioner/TR request due 8 19 14. Limited Scope TR request sent to NOP 08 06 14. TR expected mid-Jan 2015		TBD

<a href="#">Aquaculture-CO<sub>2</sub></a> , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Chlorine</a> (for aquatic plants)	205.609	JD/FT	<a href="#">2011 Crops TR</a>  <a href="#">2006 TR</a>  <a href="#">1995 TAP</a>	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Micronutrients</a> (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	<a href="#">2010 TR (Nickel)</a>  <a href="#">6/2013 Minerals TR</a>	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants)</a> (for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	<a href="#">2/2011 Crops TR</a>  <a href="#">7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR</a>	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Vitamins (B1, B12, H)</a> for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	<a href="#">4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR</a>	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD

<a href="#">Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals</a>	205.611	JR	<a href="#">2011 TR</a> (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14)	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture - Chlorine</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	JÐ/FT	No <a href="#">Crops 2011</a> <a href="#">Crops 2006</a> <a href="#">Crops 1995</a> <a href="#">Livestock 2006</a> <a href="#">Handling 2006</a>	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture – Tocopherols</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	<a href="#">2013 TR</a> <a href="#">1995 TAP</a> <a href="#">rvw</a>	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture – Vitamins</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes <a href="#">2013 TR</a>	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with Minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture - Trace Minerals</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	<a href="#">2013 TR</a>	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

2017 Sunsets TR Requests Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015					
Substance	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Ethanol §205.603	TF	Y	Draft TR sent to LS 09 24 14. Suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 01 06 15		Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015
Isopropanol §205.603	CW	Y	Draft TR sent to LS 09 24 14. Suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 01 06 15		
Chlorhexidine §205.603	JÐ/FT	2010 TR Y	TR requested 08 15 14. TR expected Jan/Feb 2015		
Copper sulfate §205.603	TF	1995 TAP Y Lmtd Scope	TR in development (expected Dec 2014)		

Electrolytes §205.603	CW	1995 TAP	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015		
Excipients §205.603	CBo	Y	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015		
Fenbendazole §205.603	FT	1999 TR Y	Combined with other paraciticides (Moxidectin and Ivermectin). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015		
Ivermectin §205.603	FT	1999 TR Y	Combined with other paraciticides (Fendbendazole and Moxidectin). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015		
Moxidectin §205.603	FT	2003 TR Y	Combined with other paraciticides (Fendbendazole and Ivermectin). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015		
Hydrated lime §205.603	TF	1995 TAP	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015		
Hydrogen peroxide §205.603	CW	Y (for Crops 205.601(a))	TR for Crops expected Jan/Feb 2015		
Iodine 205.603(a)(14) and 205.603 (b)(2)	JR	1994 TAP  Y	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 01 07 15. Suff due 03 06 15		
Mineral oil §205.603	CBo	2002 TR Y	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015		
Vitamins §205.603	CW	Y Lmtd scope	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015		

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst?	Notes	Vote	Meeting
AQ Review Legacy summary	TF		Summary of the AQ review to date.	NA	Disc Doc Spr 2015

\* **Yellow highlight** indicates committee action needed

### Agenda

- Approve notes from December 16, 2014
- 2017 sunsets (TF). Discuss TR sufficiency - Ethanol, Copper sulfate
- 2017 sunsets (FT/JD). Discuss summary - Calcium hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide and Sodium hypochlorite
- 2017 sunsets (CW). Discuss TR sufficiency - Isopropanol
- Adjourn

### Discussion

- **Notes from** December 16, 2014 approved with minor changes to initials and scheduling of materials.
- **2017 sunsets** (TF).
  - **Ethanol.** TR found sufficient. TF will let the program know.
  - **Copper sulfate.** TR is not back yet.

- **2017 sunsets - Chlorine materials: Calcium hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide and Sodium hypochlorite (FT/JD).** The co-leads discussed the proposal for chlorine materials and noted that this has been a complex issue, although the NOP provided some clarification guidance about the use of chlorine as an egg wash, which was referenced in the proposal. The crops chlorine annotation was been updated based on an NOSB recommendation, however the LS has not proposed a parallel update in the livestock listing. A separate proposal to change the livestock chlorine annotation could be made by LS outside of sunset process, however a written protocol is lacking at present, and members asked NOP for progress on this issue. JD will include in the LS review some of the information from the Handling review of chlorine and then pass it along to FT for discussion and presentation.
- **2017 sunsets - Isopropanol (CW).** The Chair read the summary that the lead provided, as CW dropped off the call. The TR was found sufficient.
- **MET** - will discuss the final proposal further on Jan 27 and vote on the Feb 2 call.
- **Aquaculture (AQ) legacy doc** - The NOP sent feedback to the LS today, which included a suggestion about incorporating a reference to the National Organic AQ working group white paper.. TF will review the NOP feedback and the white paper and will share the edited version with the group on the Jan 27 call. Members discussed the summary of public comment, which one of the members was working on. The member noted that the task was much larger or more overwhelming than he thought and indicated that he may not be able to finish it before the proposal deadline. One of the new Board members asked about the possibility of hiring help to compile the comment. Although members feel this task should be undertaken by the Board, they also noted that there isn't a confidentiality issue, since public comment is open source information. The LS Chair asked that any feedback be sent to her by Feb 6.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

### Previous LS Notes

#### **Future Call Schedule:**

**Dec 16, 2014 3:00 ET**

2017 sunset materials - Schedule discussions of TRs, checklists and votes

**Jan 6, 2015 3:00 ET**

2017 sunsets (TF). Discuss TR sufficiency - Ethanol, Copper sulfate

2017 sunsets (FT/JD). Discuss summary - Calcium hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide and Sodium hypochlorite

2017 sunsets (CW). Discuss TR sufficiency - Isopropanol

Acidified Sodium Chlorite (FT)- discuss proposal/vote

**Jan 20, 2015 3:00 ET**

Acidified Sodium Chlorite (FT)- discuss proposal/vote

2017 sunsets (TF). Discuss TR sufficiency (if TR is done) - Copper sulfate

2017 sunsets (JR). Discuss summaries - Aspirin, Lidocaine, Peracetic acid, Phosphoric acid, Procaine, Vaccines, Strychnine

2017 sunsets (CW). Discuss TR sufficiency (if TR is back) or possible questions - Electrolytes, Hydrogen peroxide, Vitamins. Discuss summaries/questions - Glucose, Oxytocin

2017 sunsets (FT). Discuss TR sufficiency/reassign - Chlorhexidine

2017 sunsets (JR). Discuss TR sufficiency - Iodine

**Jan 27, 2015** - additional call

2017 sunsets (TF). Discuss TR sufficiency - hydrated lime

MET discussion/vote

**Feb 2 2:00 ET.** Note: this is a Monday

MET- discuss proposal if more discussion is needed/vote

2017 sunsets (FT). Discuss TR sufficiency - Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin.

Discuss summaries - Poloxalene, Sucrose octanoate esters, Trace minerals, Tolazoline

2017 sunsets (CBo). Discuss TR sufficiency - Excipients, Mineral oil.

Discuss summaries - Butorphanol, Formic Acid, Xylazine

**Feb 17, 2015 3:00 ET**

2017 sunsets (TF). Discuss summaries - Atropine, EPA List 4 Inerts, Flunixin, Furosemide,

Glycerine, Magnesium hydroxide, Magnesium sulfate, Methionine

Zinc Sulfate - discuss TR/checklist

AQ legacy doc follow up discussion and vote (TF). Vote on AQ Subcomm

Mar 3, 2015 3:00 ET

Mar 17, 2015 3:00 ET

Apr 7, 2015 3:00 ET

Apr 21, 2015 3:00 ET

Spring 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOSB Training	Feb 4-5, 2015
NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2015
NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP	Feb 25, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 9, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 13, 2015
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg)	Apr 10, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 13, 2015
Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA	Week of April 27 - 30

2017 Sunsets (No TRs) Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015					
Substance	Contact	New TR reqst?	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Aspirin §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015

Atropine §205.603	TF	N (06 03)			
Butorphanol §205.603	CBo	2002 TR Y	New TR requested. Not contracted.		
Calcium hypochlorite §205.603	TF/JD	N (06 17)			
Chlorine dioxide	TF/JD	N (06 17)			
EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern §205.603	TF	N (06 03)			
Flunixin §205.603	TF	N (06 03)			
Formic Acid §205.603	CBo	N (06 17)			
Furosemide §205.603	TF	N (06 03)			
Glucose §205.603	CW	N (07 01)			
Glycerine §205.603	TF	N (06 03)			
Lidocaine §205.603	JR	N (04 01)			
Magnesium hydroxide §205.603	TF	N			
Magnesium sulfate §205.603	TF	N			
Methionine §205.603	TF	N			
Oxytocin §205.603	CW	N (07 01)			
Peracetic acid §205.603	JR	N (04 01)			
Phosphoric acid §205.603	JR	N (04 01)			
Poloxalene §205.603	FT	N			
Procaine §205.603	JR	N (04 01)			
Sodium hypochlorite §205.603	FT/JD	N (06 17)			
Strychnine 205.604	JR	N (04 01)			
Sucrose octanoate esters §205.603	FT	N			
Trace minerals §205.603	FT	N			

Vaccines §205.603	JR	N (04 01)			
Tolazoline §205.603	FT	2002 TR Y	New TR requested. Not contracted.		
Xylazine §205.603	CBo	2002 TR Y	New TR requested. Not contracted.		



Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting Notes  
Tuesday, January 20, 2015 3:00pm ET**

**Attending:** Tracy Favre, Chair (TF), Colehour Bondera (CBo), Calvin Walker (CW), Francis Thicke (FT), Jean Richardson (JR), Mac Stone (MS), Ashley Swaffar (AS), 2015 NOSB member - sitting in, Carmela Beck (CBe)

**Absent:** Joe Dickson, Vice Chair, Wendy Fulwider (WF)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

**Work Agenda**

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Methionine in organic poultry feed (MET)-petitioned	205.603	MS	<a href="#">2011 TR</a>	TR received 11 15 11	Vote scheduled for 01 27 15	Proposal Spr 2015
<a href="#">Acidified Sodium chlorite (ASC) Petition Addendum #1 Petition Addendum #2</a>	205.603 (a)(b)	JD/FT	<a href="#">2008 TR</a> <a href="#">2013 TR</a>	Petition sent to LS 06 12 12. Petition found sufficient 09 18. TR requested on 09 18 12. TR sent to LS 05 08 13. TR found suff 07 30 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled. Spring 2014 sent back to LS.	Vote scheduled for 01 27 15	Proposal Spr 2015
<a href="#">Aluminum Sulfate (PDF)</a>	205.603	JR	Y	The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015.		Proposal Spr 2015?
<a href="#">Sodium Bisulfate</a>	205.603	JR	Y	Petition sent to LS 05 27 14. Q's for petitioner/TR request due 07 28 14. TR request sent to NOP 08 06 14. TR expected Jan 2015.		TBD
<a href="#">Zinc Sulfate</a>	205.603	TF	Y	Petition sent to LS 06 16 14. Q's for petitioner/TR request due 8 19 14. Limited Scope TR request sent to NOP 08 06 14. TR expected mid-Jan 2015		TBD

<a href="#">Aquaculture-CO<sub>2</sub></a> , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Chlorine</a> (for aquatic plants)	205.609	JD/FT	<a href="#">2011 Crops TR</a> <a href="#">2006 TR</a> <a href="#">1995 TAP</a>	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Micronutrients</a> (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	<a href="#">2010 TR (Nickel)</a> <a href="#">6/2013 Minerals TR</a>	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants)</a> (for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	<a href="#">2/2011 Crops TR</a> <a href="#">7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR</a>	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Vitamins (B1, B12, H)</a> for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	<a href="#">4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR</a>	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD

<a href="#">Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals</a>	205.611	JR	<a href="#">2011 TR</a> (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture - Chlorine</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	JÐ/FT	No <a href="#">Crops 2011</a> <a href="#">Crops 2006</a> <a href="#">Crops 1995</a> <a href="#">Livestock 2006</a> <a href="#">Handling 2006</a>	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture – Tocopherols</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	<a href="#">2013 TR</a> <a href="#">1995 TAP</a> <a href="#">rvw</a>	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture – Vitamins</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes <a href="#">2013 TR</a>	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with Minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture - Trace Minerals</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	<a href="#">2013 TR</a>	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

2017 Sunsets TR Requests Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015					
Substance	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Summary discussion	Meeting
Ethanol §205.603	TF	Y	Draft TR sent to LS 09 24 14. Suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 01 06 15	Scheduled for 01 27	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015
Isopropanol §205.603	CW	Y	Draft TR sent to LS 09 24 14. Suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 01 06 15	01 06 15	
Chlorhexidine §205.603	JÐ/FT/ CW	2010 TR Y	TR requested 08 15 14. TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	Scheduled 02 02 15	

Copper sulfate §205.603	TF	1995 TAP Y Lmtd Scope	TR in development (expected Dec 2014)	Scheduled for 01 27	
Electrolytes §205.603	CW	1995 TAP	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	Scheduled for 02 02 15	
Excipients §205.603	CBo	Y	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	Scheduled for 02 02 15	
Fenbendazole §205.603	FT	1999 TR Y	Combined with other paraciticides (Moxidectin and Ivermectin). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	Scheduled for 02 02 15	
Ivermectin §205.603	FT	1999 TR Y	Combined with other paraciticides (Fenbendazole and Moxidectin). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	Scheduled for 02 02 15	
Moxidectin §205.603	FT	2003 TR Y	Combined with other paraciticides (Fenbendazole and Ivermectin). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	Scheduled for 02 02 15	
Hydrated lime §205.603	TF	1995 TAP	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	Scheduled for 01 27 15	
Hydrogen peroxide §205.603	CW	Y (for Crops 205.601(a))	TR for Crops expected Jan/Feb 2015	Scheduled for 02 02 15	
Iodine 205.603(a)(14) and 205.603 (b)(2)	JR	1994 TAP Y	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 01 07 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found sufficient 01 20 15	01 20 15	
Mineral oil §205.603	CBo	2002 TR Y	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	Scheduled for 02 02 15	
Vitamins §205.603	CW	Y Lmtd scope	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	Scheduled for 02 02 15	

**2017 Sunsets (No TRs) Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015**

Substance	Contact	New TR reqst?	Notes	Discussed	Meeting
Aspirin §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015
Atropine §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		Scheduled for 02 17 15	
Butorphanol §205.603	CBo	2002 TR Y	New TR requested. Not contracted.	Scheduled for 02 02 15	
Calcium hypochlorite §205.603	FT/ <del>JR</del>	N (06 17)		01 06 15 not completed. Scheduled for 01 27 15	
Chlorine dioxide	FT/ <del>JR</del>	N (06 17)		01 06 15 not completed. Scheduled for 01 27 15	

EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		Scheduled for 02 17 15	
Flunixin §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		Scheduled for 02 17 15	
Formic Acid §205.603	CBo	N (06 17)		Scheduled for 02 02 15	
Furosemide §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		Scheduled for 02 17 15	
Glucose §205.603	CW	N (07 01)		01 20 15	
Glycerine §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		Scheduled for 02 17 15	
Lidocaine §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Magnesium hydroxide §205.603	TF	N		Scheduled for 02 17 15	
Magnesium sulfate §205.603	TF	N		Scheduled for 02 17 15	
Methionine §205.603	TF	N		Scheduled for 02 17 15	
Oxytocin §205.603	CW	N (07 01)		01 20 15	
Peracetic acid §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Phosphoric acid §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Poloxalene §205.603	FT	N		Scheduled for 02 02 15	
Procaine §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Sodium hypochlorite §205.603	FT/JD	N (06 17)		01 06 15 not completed. Scheduled for 01 27 15	
Strychnine 205.604	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Sucrose octanoate esters §205.603	FT	N		Scheduled for 02 02 15	
Trace minerals §205.603	FT	N		Scheduled for 02 02 15	
Vaccines §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Tolazoline §205.603	FT	2002 TR Y	New TR requested. Not contracted.	Scheduled for 02 02 15	
Xylazine §205.603	CBo	2002 TR Y	New TR requested. Not contracted.	Scheduled for 02 02 15	

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst?	Notes	Vote	Meeting
AQ Review Legacy summary	TF		Summary of the AQ review to date.		Disc Doc Spr 2015

\* **Yellow highlight** indicates committee action needed

### Agenda

- Approve notes from January 6, 2015
- 2017 sunsets (JR). Discuss TR sufficiency - Iodine
- Acidified Sodium Chlorite - discuss proposal/vote
- 2017 sunsets (TF). Discuss TR sufficiency (if TR is done) - Copper sulfate
- 2017 sunsets (JR). Discuss summaries - Aspirin, Lidocaine, Peracetic acid, Phosphoric acid, Procaine, Vaccines, Strychnine
- 2017 sunsets (CW). Discuss TR sufficiency (if TR is back) or possible questions - Electrolytes, Hydrogen peroxide, Vitamins. Discuss summaries/questions - Glucose, Oxytocin
- 2017 sunsets (FT). Discuss TR sufficiency/reassign - Chlorhexidine
- Adjourn

### Discussion

- **Notes from** January 6, 2015 approved with one minor correction to the initials of a lead reviewer.
- **Iodine (JR)** - Members discussed the material and the TR was found sufficient.
- **Acidified Sodium Chlorite (FT)** - The group discussed the proposal and added some questions for posting. A member had a question about the format of the proposal and JR offered to send an example along with some additional comments. Another member noted that it would be helpful to read the TR for Iodine, which has a reference to acidified sodium chlorite. The LS deferred the vote to next call.
- **2017 sunsets (TF)**. Discuss TR sufficiency if TR is ready - Copper sulfate. Deferred until TR is received.
- **2017 sunsets (JR)**. The lead presented the following materials for discussion. Minor edits will be made and the summaries will be posted for comments at the spring 2015 NOSB meeting.
  - **Aspirin (205.603(a))** - Approved for healthcare use to reduce inflammation. The questions that were added will be deleted as they are redundant with what is in the preamble for the first posting of the sunset materials.
  - **Lidocaine (205.603(b))** - As a local anesthetic. Use requires a withdrawal period of 90 days after administering to livestock intended for slaughter and 7 days after administering to dairy animals. The LS will add questions for posting
  - **Procaine (205.603(b))** - As a local anesthetic. Use requires a withdrawal period of 90 days after administering to livestock intended for slaughter and 7 days after administering to dairy animals. The LS will add questions for posting
  - **Peracetic acid** - For sanitizing facility and processing equipment. Widely used as a milder alternative to some harsher chemicals.
  - **Phosphoric acid** - Allowed as a cleaner for equipment, provided that no contact with organically managed livestock or land occurs.

- **Vaccines** - Listed at §205.105(e)), the use of excluded methods is prohibited in organic production. To date the NOSB has not recommended any vaccines made with excluded methods be added to the National List. Members further discussed the complexity of these materials and the fact that the previous work was based on a request from the NOP, whereas this work is for sunset review. Members will not include any additional questions when the material is posted for comment.
- **Strychnine** - Prohibited substance listed at §205.604. No additional information is sought.
- CW thanked Joe Dickson and Wendy Fulwider for their service, although neither one of them was able to be on the call.
- **2017 sunsets (CW)**
  - **Electrolytes** - The NOP indicated that after reviewing the draft TR they had many questions and therefore suggested that the LS delay the discussion until the TR is ready.
  - **Hydrogen peroxide** - waiting on TR. Relisted in 2012 without annotation.
  - **Vitamins** - Didn't have questions waiting on TR
  - **Glucose** - Relisted in 2010. There appears to be no new information since then, therefore the LS will post the summary without additional questions
  - **Oxytocin** - A hormone that is found to be essential. There was a 2005 TR, and previous Boards renewed the material without hesitation.
- **2017 sunsets (FT)**. Chlorhexidine will be reviewed by FT and CW.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

### Previous LS Notes

#### **Future Call Schedule:**

#### **Jan 6, 2015 3:00 ET**

2017 sunsets (TF). Discuss TR sufficiency - Ethanol, Copper sulfate - deferred to Jan 20)

2017 sunsets (FT/JD). Discuss summary - Calcium hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide and Sodium hypochlorite

2017 sunsets (CW). Discuss TR sufficiency - Isopropanol

Acidified Sodium Chlorite (FT)- discuss proposal/vote

#### **Jan 20, 2015 3:00 ET**

- Acidified Sodium Chlorite (FT) - discuss proposal/vote - deferred
- 2017 sunsets (TF). Discuss Copper sulfate TR sufficiency if TR is ready. Discuss summary/questions for Ethanol - deferred
- 2017 sunsets (JR). Discuss summaries - Aspirin, Lidocaine, Peracetic acid, Phosphoric acid, Procaine, Vaccines, Strychnine
- 2017 sunsets (CW). Discuss TR sufficiency (if TR is back) or possible questions - Electrolytes, Hydrogen peroxide, Vitamins. Discuss summaries/questions - Glucose, Oxytocin
- 2017 sunsets (FT). Discuss TR sufficiency/reassign - Chlorhexidine - deferred to Feb 2
- 2017 sunsets (JR). Discuss TR sufficiency - Iodine

#### **Jan 27, 2015 - additional call**

- Acidified Sodium Chlorite (FT) - discuss proposal/vote
- 2017 sunsets (FT/JD). Discuss summary - Calcium hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide and Sodium hypochlorite
- 2017 sunsets (TF). Discuss TR sufficiency (if TR is ready)/questions - Copper sulfate
- 2017 sunsets (TF). Discuss summary/questions for Ethanol
- 2017 sunsets (TF). Discuss TR sufficiency - Hydrated lime

- MET discussion/vote

**Feb 2 2:00 ET.** Note: this is a Monday

- MET- discuss proposal if more discussion is needed/vote
- 2017 sunsets (CW). Discuss TR sufficiency (if TR is back) or possible questions – Electrolytes, hydrogen peroxide, vitamins
- 2017 sunsets (FT). Discuss TR sufficiency - Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin.  
Discuss summaries - Poloxalene, Sucrose octanoate esters, Trace minerals, Tolazoline
- 2017 sunsets (FT). Discuss TR sufficiency/questions- Chlorhexidine
- 2017 sunsets (CBo). Discuss TR sufficiency - Excipients, Mineral oil.  
Discuss summaries - Butorphanol, Formic Acid, Xylazine

**Feb 17, 2015 3:00 ET**

- 2017 sunsets (TF). Discuss summaries - Atropine, EPA List 4 Inerts, Flunixin, Furosemide, Glycerine, Magnesium hydroxide, Magnesium sulfate, Methionine  
Zinc Sulfate - discuss TR/checklist
- AQ legacy doc follow up discussion and vote (TF). Vote on AQ Subcomm

Mar 3, 2015 3:00 ET

Mar 17, 2015 3:00 ET

Apr 7, 2015 3:00 ET

Apr 21, 2015 3:00 ET

Spring 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOSB Training	Feb 4-5, 2015
NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2015
NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP	Feb 25, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 9, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 13, 2015
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg)	Apr 10, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 13, 2015
Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA	Week of April 27 - 30



Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting Notes  
Tuesday, January 27, 2015 3:00pm ET**

**Attending:** Tracy Favre, Chair (TF); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Jean Richardson (JR); Ashley Swaffar (AS); Francis Thicke (FT)

**Absent:** Paula Daniels (PD), Mac Stone (MS); Calvin Walker, Vice Chair (CW)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

**Work Agenda**

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Methionine in organic poultry feed (MET)-petitioned	205.603	MS	<a href="#">2011 TR</a>	TR received 11 15 11	Vote scheduled for 02 02 15	Proposal Spr 2015
<a href="#">Acidified Sodium chlorite (ASC) Petition Addendum #1 Petition Addendum #2</a>	205.603 (a)(b)	JD/FT	<a href="#">2008 TR</a> <a href="#">2013 TR</a>	Petition sent to LS 06 12 12. Petition found sufficient 09 18. TR requested on 09 18 12. TR sent to LS 05 08 13. TR found suff 07 30 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled. Spring 2014 sent back to LS.	01 27 15	Proposal Spr 2015
<a href="#">Aluminum Sulfate (PDF)</a>	205.603	JR	Y	The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015.		Proposal Spr 2015?
<a href="#">Sodium Bisulfate</a>	205.603	JR	Y	Petition sent to LS 05 27 14. Q's for petitioner/TR request due 07 28 14. TR request sent to NOP 08 06 14. TR expected Jan 2015.		TBD
<a href="#">Zinc Sulfate</a>	205.603	TF	Y	Petition sent to LS 06 16 14. Q's for petitioner/TR request due 8 19 14. Limited Scope TR request sent to NOP 08 06 14. TR expected mid-Jan 2015		TBD

<a href="#">Aquaculture-CO<sub>2</sub></a> , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Chlorine</a> (for aquatic plants)	205.609	JD/FT	<a href="#">2011 Crops TR</a> <a href="#">2006 TR</a> <a href="#">1995 TAP</a>	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Micronutrients</a> (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	<a href="#">2010 TR (Nickel)</a> <a href="#">6/2013 Minerals TR</a>	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants)</a> (for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	<a href="#">2/2011 Crops TR</a>  <a href="#">7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR</a>	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Vitamins (B1, B12, H)</a> for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	<a href="#">4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR</a>	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD

<a href="#">Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals</a>	205.611	JR	<a href="#">2011 TR</a> (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture - Chlorine</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	JÐ/FT	No <a href="#">Crops 2011</a> <a href="#">Crops 2006</a> <a href="#">Crops 1995</a> <a href="#">Livestock 2006</a> <a href="#">Handling 2006</a>	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture – Tocopherols</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	<a href="#">2013 TR</a> <a href="#">1995 TAP</a> <a href="#">rvw</a>	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture – Vitamins</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes <a href="#">2013 TR</a>	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with Minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture - Trace Minerals</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	<a href="#">2013 TR</a>	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

2017 Sunsets TR Requests Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015					
Substance	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Summary discussion	Meeting
Ethanol §205.603	TF	Y	Draft TR sent to LS 09 24 14. Suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 01 06 15	01 27 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015
Isopropanol §205.603	CW	Y	Draft TR sent to LS 09 24 14. Suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 01 06 15	01 06 15	
Chlorhexidine §205.603	JÐ/FT/ CW	2010 TR Y	TR requested 08 15 14. TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	Scheduled 02 02 15	

Copper sulfate §205.603	TF	1995 TAP Y Lmtd Scope	TR in development (expected Dec 2014)	Scheduled for 02 02 15	
Electrolytes §205.603	CW	1995 TAP	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	Scheduled for 02 02 15	
Excipients §205.603	CBo	Y	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	Scheduled for 02 02 15	
Fenbendazole §205.603	FT	1999 TR Y	Combined with other paraciticides (Moxidectin and Ivermectin). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	Scheduled for 02 02 15	
Ivermectin §205.603	FT	1999 TR Y	Combined with other paraciticides (Fenbendazole and Moxidectin). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	Scheduled for 02 02 15	
Moxidectin §205.603	FT	2003 TR Y	Combined with other paraciticides (Fenbendazole and Ivermectin). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	Scheduled for 02 02 15	
Hydrated lime §205.603	TF	1995 TAP	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	Scheduled for 02 02 15	
Hydrogen peroxide §205.603	CW	Y (for Crops 205.601(a))	TR for Crops expected Jan/Feb 2015	Scheduled for 02 02 15	
Iodine 205.603(a)(14) and 205.603 (b)(2)	JR	1994 TAP <a href="#">2015 TR</a>	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 01 07 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found sufficient 01 20 15	01 20 15 and 01 27 15	
Mineral oil §205.603	CBo	2002 TR Y	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	Scheduled for 02 02 15	
Vitamins §205.603	CW	Y Lmtd scope	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	Scheduled for 02 02 15	

**2017 Sunsets (No TRs) Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015**

Substance	Contact	New TR reqst?	Notes	Discussed	Meeting
Aspirin §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015
Atropine §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		Scheduled for 02 17 15	
Butorphanol §205.603	CBo	2002 TR Y	New TR requested. Not contracted.	Scheduled for 02 02 15	
Calcium hypochlorite §205.603	FT/ <del>JR</del>	N (06 17)		01 06 15 and 01 27 15	
Chlorine dioxide	FT/ <del>JR</del>	N (06 17)		01 06 15 and 01 27 15	
EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern §205.603	TF	N (06 03)	TR for NPEs sent to CS 01 30 15. No action by LS needed.	Scheduled for 02 17 15	

Flunixin §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		Scheduled for 02 17 15	
Formic Acid §205.603	CBo	N (06 17)		Scheduled for 02 02 15	
Furosemide §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		Scheduled for 02 17 15	
Glucose §205.603	CW	N (07 01)		01 20 15	
Glycerine §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		Scheduled for 02 17 15	
Lidocaine §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Magnesium hydroxide §205.603	TF	N		Scheduled for 02 17 15	
Magnesium sulfate §205.603	TF	N		Scheduled for 02 17 15	
Methionine §205.603	TF	N		Scheduled for 02 17 15	
Oxytocin §205.603	CW	N (07 01)		01 20 15	
Peracetic acid §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Phosphoric acid §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Poloxalene §205.603	FT	N		Scheduled for 02 02 15	
Procaine §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Sodium hypochlorite §205.603	FT/JD	N (06 17)		01 06 15 and 01 27 15	
Strychnine 205.604	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Sucrose octanoate esters §205.603	FT	N		Scheduled for 02 02 15	
Trace minerals §205.603	FT	N		Scheduled for 02 02 15	
Vaccines §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Tolazoline §205.603	FT	2002 TR Y	New TR requested. Not contracted.	Scheduled for 02 02 15	
Xylazine §205.603	CBo	2002 TR Y	New TR requested. Not contracted.	Scheduled for 02 02 15	

## Other projects

Project	Contact	TR Reqst?	Notes	Vote	Meeting
AQ Review Legacy summary	TF		Summary of the AQ review to date.		Disc Doc Spr 2015

\* **Yellow highlight** indicates committee action needed

### Agenda

- Approve notes from January 20, 2015
- Acidified Sodium Chlorite (FT) - discuss proposal/vote
- 2017 sunsets (FT). Discuss summary - Calcium hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide and Sodium hypochlorite
- 2017 sunsets (TF). Discuss summary/questions for Ethanol
- 2017 sunsets (TF). Discuss TR sufficiency - Hydrated lime
- 2017 sunsets (JR). Discuss summary/questions - Iodine
- MET discussion/vote
- Adjourn

### Discussion

- **Notes from** January 20, 2015 approved with minor changes.
- **Petition: Acidified Sodium Chlorite (ASC) (FT/JR)** - JR noted that the ASC review will be helpful when discussing iodine. ASC was discussed at the spring 2014 NOSB meeting and after receiving public comment the NOSB chose to send the proposal back to Subcommittee. In addition to public comment, , additional information provided by the petitioner and new information about the use and demand of iodine and ASC in the dairy industry, the LS feels that it has adequate information to bring this material to the spring 2015 meeting for a vote. The NOP suggested some minor edits to checklist based on the narrative.

Motion to classify Motion to classify Acidified Sodium Chlorite (CAS # 7758-19-2 (sodium chlorite) and CAS # 14998-27-7 (chlorous acid)) as synthetic.

Motion by: JR

Seconded by: FT

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 3 Recuse: 0

Motion to add Acidified Sodium Chlorite (CAS # 7758-19-2 (sodium chlorite) and CAS # 14998-27-7 (chlorous acid)) as synthetic as petitioned at 205.603(a) and 205.603(b) with the following annotation: Acidified Sodium Chlorite, allowed for use on organic livestock as a pre and post teat dip treatment.

Motion by: JR

Seconded by: FT

Additional Discussion: One member stated his objection to the routine reliance on preventive synthetics and as such voted accordingly.

Yes: 4 No: 1 Abstain: 0 Absent: 3 Recuse: 0

- **2017 sunsets: Chlorine Materials (Calcium hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide and Sodium hypochlorite) (FT).** The three materials were reviewed together, although the lead noted that

he listed different modes of action. Members discussed the questions for public comment that were added to the review. Questions included whether all three of the chlorine materials were essential, and whether there were alternatives for Livestock production.

- **2017 sunsets: Ethanol (TF). Discuss summary/questions. The lead summarized the material noting that there was a 1995 TAP report and a 2014 TR.** Ethanol is a volatile, flammable, colorless, sanitizer and disinfectant. The lead will make some minor edits, add a question about the most common uses, and will forward the final document to the NOP.
- **2017 sunsets: Hydrated lime (TF). Discuss TR sufficiency** - deferred to next call because TR is not back yet.
- **2017 sunsets (JR). Iodine. The LS** discussed the TR. Iodine is common and essential in teat dips as it is very effective. A member noted that there are two primary forms but many forms exist. The LS will add questions regarding surfactants, and discussed the TR on inerts that will aid in the review of Iodine, as it will contain info on Nonylphenol Ethoxylates (NPEs) used in teat dips.
- **MET discussion/vote (ALL) deferred to next call.**
- The LS Chair reminded the members that the next call is scheduled for Monday February 2
- The LS Chair asked that any feedback on the AQ legacy Doc be sent to her by February 6
- **The meeting was adjourned**

### Previous LS Notes

#### **Future Call Schedule:**

##### **Jan 20, 2015 3:00 ET**

- Acidified Sodium Chlorite (FT) - discuss proposal/vote - deferred
- 2017 sunsets (TF). Discuss Copper sulfate TR sufficiency if TR is ready. Discuss summary/questions for Ethanol - deferred
- 2017 sunsets (JR). Discuss summaries - Aspirin, Lidocaine, Peracetic acid, Phosphoric acid, Procaine, Vaccines, Strychnine
- 2017 sunsets (CW). Discuss TR sufficiency (if TR is back) or possible questions - Electrolytes, Hydrogen peroxide, Vitamins. Discuss summaries/questions - Glucose, Oxytocin
- 2017 sunsets (FT). Discuss TR sufficiency/reassign - Chlorhexidine - deferred to Feb 2
- 2017 sunsets (JR). Discuss TR sufficiency - Iodine

##### **Jan 27, 2015 - additional call**

- Acidified Sodium Chlorite (FT) - discuss proposal/vote
- 2017 sunsets (FT/JD). Discuss summary - Calcium hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide and Sodium hypochlorite
- 2017 sunsets (TF). Discuss TR sufficiency (if TR is ready)/questions - Copper sulfate
- 2017 sunsets (TF). Discuss summary/questions for Ethanol
- 2017 sunsets (TF). Discuss TR sufficiency - Hydrated lime
- 2017 sunsets (JR). Discuss summary/questions - Iodine
- MET discussion/vote

**Feb 2, 2015 3:00 ET.** Note: this is a Monday

- MET- discuss proposal if more discussion is needed/vote
- 2017 sunsets (CW). Discuss TR sufficiency (if TR is back) or possible questions – Electrolytes, hydrogen peroxide, vitamins
- 2017 sunsets (FT). Discuss TR sufficiency - Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin.  
Discuss summaries - Poloxalene, Sucrose octanoate esters, Trace minerals, Tolazoline
- 2017 sunsets (FT). Discuss TR sufficiency/questions- Chlorhexidine
- 2017 sunsets (CBo). Discuss TR sufficiency - Excipients, Mineral oil.  
Discuss summaries - Butorphanol, Formic Acid, Xylazine
- 2017 sunsets (TF). Discuss TR sufficiency - Hydrated lime
- 2017 sunsets: Copper sulfate (TF). Discuss TR sufficiency (if TR is returned)

**Feb 17, 2015 3:00 ET**

- 2017 sunsets (TF). Discuss summaries - Atropine, EPA List 4 Inerts, Flunixin, Furosemide, Glycerine, Magnesium hydroxide, Magnesium sulfate, Methionine  
Zinc Sulfate - discuss TR/checklist

**Feb 24, 2015 3:00 ET**

- AQ legacy doc follow-up discussion and vote (TF). Vote

**Mar 3, 2015 3:00 ET**

**Mar 17, 2015 3:00 ET**

**Apr 7, 2015 3:00 ET**

**Apr 21, 2015 3:00 ET**

Spring 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOSB Training	Feb 4-5, 2015
NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2015
NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP	Feb 25, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 9, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 13, 2015
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg)	Apr 10, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 13, 2015
Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA	Week of April 27 - 30



Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting Notes  
Tuesday, February 2, 2015 3:00pm ET**

**Attending:** Tracy Favre, Chair (TF); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Ashley Swaffar (AS); Francis Thicke (FT); Paula Daniels (PD); Calvin Walker, Vice Chair (CW)

**Absent:** Jean Richardson (JR); Mac Stone (MS)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

**Work Agenda**

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Methionine in organic poultry feed (MET)-petitioned	205.603	MS	<a href="#">2011 TR</a>	TR received 11 15 11	Vote scheduled for 02 17 15	Proposal Spr 2015
<a href="#">Acidified Sodium chlorite (ASC) Petition Addendum #1 Petition Addendum #2</a>	205.603 (a)(b)	JD/FT	<a href="#">2008 TR</a> <a href="#">2013 TR</a>	Petition sent to LS 06 12 12. Petition found sufficient 09 18. TR requested on 09 18 12. TR sent to LS 05 08 13. TR found suff 07 30 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled. Spring 2014 sent back to LS.	01 27 15	Proposal Spr 2015
<a href="#">Aluminum Sulfate (PDF)</a>	205.603	JR	Y	The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015.		Proposal Fall 2015
<a href="#">Sodium Bisulfate</a>	205.603	JR	Y	Petition sent to LS 05 27 14. Q's for petitioner/TR request due 07 28 14. TR request sent to NOP 08 06 14. TR expected Jan 2015.		TBD
<a href="#">Zinc Sulfate</a>	205.603	TF	Y	Petition sent to LS 06 16 14. Q's for petitioner/TR request due 8 19 14. Limited Scope TR request sent to NOP 08 06 14. TR expected mid-Jan 2015		TBD

<a href="#">Aquaculture-CO<sub>2</sub></a> , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Chlorine</a> (for aquatic plants)	205.609	JD/FT	<a href="#">2011 Crops TR</a> <a href="#">2006 TR</a> <a href="#">1995 TAP</a>	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Micronutrients</a> (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	<a href="#">2010 TR (Nickel)</a> <a href="#">6/2013 Minerals TR</a>	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants)</a> (for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	<a href="#">2/2011 Crops TR</a>  <a href="#">7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR</a>	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Vitamins (B1, B12, H)</a> for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	<a href="#">4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR</a>	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD

<a href="#">Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals</a>	205.611	JR	<a href="#">2011 TR</a> (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture - Chlorine</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	JÐ/FT	No <a href="#">Crops 2011</a> <a href="#">Crops 2006</a> <a href="#">Crops 1995</a> <a href="#">Livestock 2006</a> <a href="#">Handling 2006</a>	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture – Tocopherols</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	<a href="#">2013 TR</a> <a href="#">1995 TAP</a> <a href="#">rvw</a>	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture – Vitamins</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes <a href="#">2013 TR</a>	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with Minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture - Trace Minerals</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	<a href="#">2013 TR</a>	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

2017 Sunsets TR Requests Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015					
Substance	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Summary discussion	Meeting
Ethanol §205.603	TF	Y	Draft TR sent to LS 09 24 14. Suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 01 06 15	01 27 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015
Isopropanol §205.603	CW	Y	Draft TR sent to LS 09 24 14. Suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 01 06 15	01 06 15	
Chlorhexidine §205.603	JÐ/FT/ CW	2010 TR Y	TR requested 08 15 14. TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	02 02 15	

Copper sulfate §205.603	TF	1995 TAP Y Lmtd Scope	TR in development (expected Dec 2014)	Rescheduled for 02 17 15	
Electrolytes §205.603	CW	1995 TAP	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	Rescheduled for 02 17 15	
Excipients §205.603	CBo	Y	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	Rescheduled for 02 17 15	
Fenbendazole §205.603	FT	1999 TR Y	Combined with other paraciticides (Moxidectin and Ivermectin). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	Rescheduled for 02 17 15	
Ivermectin §205.603	FT	1999 TR Y	Combined with other paraciticides (Fenbendazole and Moxidectin). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	Rescheduled for 02 17 15	
Moxidectin §205.603	FT	2003 TR Y	Combined with other paraciticides (Fenbendazole and Ivermectin). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	Rescheduled for 02 17 15	
Hydrated lime §205.603	TF	1995 TAP	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	Rescheduled for 02 17 15	
Hydrogen peroxide §205.603	CW	Y (for Crops 205.601(a))	TR for Crops expected Jan/Feb 2015	Rescheduled for 02 17 15	
Iodine 205.603(a)(14) and 205.603 (b)(2)	JR	1994 TAP <a href="#">2015 TR</a>	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 01 07 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found sufficient 01 20 15	01 20 15 and 01 27 15	
Mineral oil §205.603	PD	2002 TR Y	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	Rescheduled for 02 17 15	
Vitamins §205.603	CW	Y Lmtd scope	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	Rescheduled for 02 17 15	

**2017 Sunsets (No TRs) Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015**

Substance	Contact	New TR reqst?	Notes	Discussed	Meeting
Aspirin §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015
Atropine §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		Scheduled for 02 17 15	
Butorphanol §205.603	CBo	2002 TR Y	New TR requested. Not contracted.	Rescheduled for 02 17 15	
Calcium hypochlorite §205.603	FT/ <del>JR</del>	N (06 17)		01 06 15 and 01 27 15	
Chlorine dioxide	FT/ <del>JR</del>	N (06 17)		01 06 15 and 01 27 15	
EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern §205.603	TF	N (06 03)	TR for NPEs sent to CS 01 30 15. No action by LS needed.	Scheduled for 02 17 15	

Flunixin §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		Scheduled for 02 17 15	
Formic Acid §205.603	CBo	N (06 17)		Rescheduled for 02 17 15	
Furosemide §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		Scheduled for 02 17 15	
Glucose §205.603	CW	N (07 01)		01 20 15	
Glycerine §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		Scheduled for 02 17 15	
Lidocaine §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Magnesium hydroxide §205.603	TF	N		Scheduled for 02 17 15	
Magnesium sulfate §205.603	TF	N		Scheduled for 02 17 15	
Methionine §205.603	TF	N		Scheduled for 02 17 15	
Oxytocin §205.603	CW	N (07 01)		01 20 15	
Peracetic acid §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Phosphoric acid §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Poloxalene §205.603	FT	N		02 02 15	
Procaine §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Sodium hypochlorite §205.603	FT/JD	N (06 17)		01 06 15 and 01 27 15	
Strychnine 205.604	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Sucrose octanoate esters §205.603	FT	N		02 02 15	
Trace minerals §205.603	FT	N		02 02 15	
Vaccines §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Tolazoline §205.603	FT	2002 TR Y	New TR requested. Not contracted.	02 02 15	
Xylazine §205.603	CBo	2002 TR Y	New TR requested. Not contracted.	Rescheduled for 02 17 15	

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst?	Notes	Vote	Meeting
AQ Review Legacy summary	TF		Summary of the AQ review to date.	Scheduled for 02 17	Disc Doc Spr 2015

\* **Yellow highlight** indicates committee action needed

### Agenda

- Approve notes from January 27, 2015
- MET- discuss proposal/vote
- 2017 sunsets (CW). Discuss TR sufficiency or possible questions - Electrolytes, hydrogen peroxide, vitamins
- 2017 sunsets (FT). Discuss TR sufficiency - Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin. Discuss summaries - Poloxalene, Sucrose octanoate esters, Trace minerals, Tolazoline
- 2017 sunsets (FT). Discuss TR sufficiency/questions- Chlorhexidine
- 2017 sunsets (CBo). Discuss TR sufficiency - Excipients, Mineral oil. Discuss summaries - Butorphanol, Formic Acid, Xylazine
- 2017 sunsets (TF). Discuss TR sufficiency - Hydrated lime
- 2017 sunsets: Copper sulfate (TF). Discuss TR sufficiency (if TR is returned)
- Adjourn

### Discussion

- **Notes from** January 27, 2015 approved with minor changes.
- **MET- discuss proposal/vote.** The group discussed the most recent document and the LS Chair asked for feedback. She noted that this final version is a very reasonable approach and thanked the group for the enormous effort weighing all the comments and reaching a compromise. The Chair said that this approach is very supportive of animal welfare. She will make the final edits to the table in the proposal and the members will vote on the next call.
- **2017 sunsets (CW). Electrolytes, hydrogen peroxide, vitamins** - Deferred to next call
- **2017 sunsets (FT):**
  - **Fenbendazole** - TR sufficiency deferred to next call
  - **Ivermectin** - Deferred to next call
  - **Moxidectin** - Deferred to next call
  - **Poloxalene** - Used as a remedy for bloating. The LS will not pose additional questions
  - **Sucrose octanoate esters.** No additional questions will be included
  - **Trace minerals** - No additional questions will be included
  - **Tolazoline** - EBR will forward the FR notice for 2007 addition of medications to the National List, which explains the reasoning behind the withdrawal times.
  - **Chlorhexidine.** Synthetic. NOP noted a recent change to the annotation so chlorhexidine is used as surgical treatment, not only in emergencies. It also is a teat dip. The LS will add questions about use patterns and essentiality.
- **2017 sunsets (CBo). Excipients, Mineral oil - Discuss TR sufficiency.** Deferred to next call. The NOP suggested separating excipients and mineral oil, as excipients is a very dense review. CBo will review excipients and PD will review mineral oil.
- **2017 sunsets (CBo) Butorphanol, Formic Acid, Xylazine - Discuss summaries.** Deferred to next call
- **2017 sunsets (TF). Hydrated lime** Deferred to next call

- **2017 sunsets: Copper sulfate (TF).** Deferred to next call
- **The meeting was adjourned**

### **Previous LS Notes**

#### **Future Call Schedule:**

**Jan 27, 2015** - additional call

- Acidified Sodium Chlorite (FT) - discuss proposal/vote
- 2017 sunsets (FT/JD). Discuss summary - Calcium hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide and Sodium hypochlorite
- 2017 sunsets (TF). Discuss TR sufficiency (if TR is ready)/questions - Copper sulfate
- 2017 sunsets (TF). Discuss summary/questions for Ethanol
- 2017 sunsets (TF). Discuss TR sufficiency - Hydrated lime
- 2017 sunsets (JR). Discuss summary/questions - Iodine
- MET discussion/vote

**Feb 2, 2015 3:00 ET.** Note: this is a Monday

- MET- discuss proposal if more discussion is needed/vote
- 2017 sunsets (CW). Discuss TR sufficiency (if TR is back) or possible questions – Electrolytes, hydrogen peroxide, vitamins
- 2017 sunsets (FT). Discuss TR sufficiency - Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin. Discuss summaries - Poloxalene, Sucrose octanoate esters, Trace minerals, Tolazoline
- 2017 sunsets (FT). Discuss TR sufficiency/questions- Chlorhexidine
- 2017 sunsets (CBo). Discuss TR sufficiency - Excipients, Mineral oil. Discuss summaries - Butorphanol, Formic Acid, Xylazine
- 2017 sunsets (TF). Discuss TR sufficiency - Hydrated lime
- 2017 sunsets: Copper sulfate (TF). Discuss TR sufficiency (if TR is returned)

**Feb 17, 2015 3:00 ET**

- 2017 sunsets (CW). Discuss TR sufficiency (if TR is back) or possible questions - Electrolytes, hydrogen peroxide, Vitamins
- 2017 sunsets (FT). Discuss TR sufficiency - Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin.
- 2017 sunsets (FT). Discuss TR sufficiency/continue discussion about questions - Chlorhexidine
- 2017 sunsets (CBo). Discuss TR sufficiency (if TR was received) - Excipients
- 2017 sunsets (PD). Discuss TR sufficiency (if TR was received) - Mineral oil
- 2017 sunsets (CBo). Discuss summaries - Butorphanol, Formic Acid, Xylazine
- 2017 sunsets (TF). Discuss TR sufficiency - Hydrated lime
- 2017 sunsets: Copper sulfate (TF). Discuss TR sufficiency (if TR is returned)
- 2017 sunsets (TF). Discuss summaries - Atropine, EPA List 4 Inerts, Flunixin, Furosemide, Glycerine, Magnesium hydroxide, Magnesium sulfate, Methionine Zinc Sulfate - discuss TR/checklist
- MET- discuss proposal/vote

**Feb 24, 2015 3:00 ET**

- AQ legacy doc follow-up discussion and vote (TF). Vote

**Mar 3, 2015 3:00 ET**

**Mar 17, 2015 3:00 ET**

**Apr 7, 2015 3:00 ET**

**Apr 21, 2015 3:00 ET**

Spring 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOSB Training	Feb 4-5, 2015
NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2015
NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP	Feb 25, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 9, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 13, 2015
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg)	Apr 10, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 13, 2015
Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA	Week of April 27 - 30



Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting Notes  
Tuesday, February 17, 2015 3:00pm ET**

**Attending:** Tracy Favre, Chair (TF); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Ashley Swaffar (AS); Francis Thicke (FT); Paula Daniels (PD); Calvin Walker, Vice Chair (CW); Jean Richardson (JR); Mac Stone (MS)

**Absent:** none

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

**Work Agenda**

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Methionine in organic poultry feed (MET)-petitioned	205.603	MS	<a href="#">2011 TR</a>	TR received 11 15 11	02 17 15	Proposal Spr 2015
<a href="#">Acidified Sodium chlorite (ASC) Petition Addendum #1 Petition Addendum #2</a>	205.603 (a)(b)	JD/FT	<a href="#">2008 TR</a> <a href="#">2013 TR</a>	Petition sent to LS 06 12 12. Petition found sufficient 09 18. TR requested on 09 18 12. TR sent to LS 05 08 13. TR found suff 07 30 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled. Spring 2014 sent back to LS.	01 27 15	Proposal Spr 2015
<a href="#">Aluminum Sulfate (PDF)</a>	205.603	JR	Y	The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015.		Proposal Fall 2015
<a href="#">Sodium Bisulfate</a>	205.603	JR	Y	Petition sent to LS 05 27 14. Q's for petitioner/TR request due 07 28 14. TR request sent to NOP 08 06 14. TR expected Jan 2015.		TBD
<a href="#">Zinc Sulfate</a>	205.603	TF	Y	Petition sent to LS 06 16 14. Q's for petitioner/TR request due 8 19 14. Limited Scope TR request sent to NOP 08 06 14. TR expected mid-Jan 2015		TBD

<a href="#">Aquaculture-CO<sub>2</sub></a> , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Chlorine</a> (for aquatic plants)	205.609	JD/FT	<a href="#">2011 Crops TR</a> <a href="#">2006 TR</a> <a href="#">1995 TAP</a>	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Micronutrients</a> (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	<a href="#">2010 TR (Nickel)</a> <a href="#">6/2013 Minerals TR</a>	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants)</a> (for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	<a href="#">2/2011 Crops TR</a>  <a href="#">7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR</a>	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Vitamins (B1, B12, H)</a> for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	<a href="#">4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR</a>	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD

<a href="#">Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals</a>	205.611	JR	<a href="#">2011 TR</a> (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture - Chlorine</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	JÐ/FT	No <a href="#">Crops 2011</a> <a href="#">Crops 2006</a> <a href="#">Crops 1995</a> <a href="#">Livestock 2006</a> <a href="#">Handling 2006</a>	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture – Tocopherols</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	<a href="#">2013 TR</a> <a href="#">1995 TAP</a> <a href="#">rvw</a>	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture – Vitamins</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes <a href="#">2013 TR</a>	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with Minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture - Trace Minerals</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	<a href="#">2013 TR</a>	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

2017 Sunsets TR Requests Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015					
Substance	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Summary discussion	Meeting
Ethanol §205.603	TF	Y	Draft TR sent to LS 09 24 14. Suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 01 06 15	01 27 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015
Isopropanol §205.603	CW	Y	Draft TR sent to LS 09 24 14. Suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 01 06 15	01 06 15	
Chlorhexidine §205.603	JÐ/FT/ CW	2010 TR Y	TR requested 08 15 14. TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	02 02 15	

Copper sulfate §205.603	TF	1995 TAP Y Lmtd Scope	TR in development (expected Dec 2014). TR sent to LS 02 13 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	Rescheduled for 02 24 15	
Electrolytes §205.603	CW	1995 TAP	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	Rescheduled for 02 24 15	
Excipients §205.603	CBe/JR	Y	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	Rescheduled for 02 24 15	
Fenbendazole §205.603	FT	1999 TR Y	Combined with other paraciticides (Moxidectin and Ivermectin). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	Rescheduled for 02 24 15	
Ivermectin §205.603	FT	1999 TR Y	Combined with other paraciticides (Fenbendazole and Moxidectin). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	Rescheduled for 02 24 15	
Moxidectin §205.603	FT	2003 TR Y	Combined with other paraciticides (Fenbendazole and Ivermectin). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	Rescheduled for 02 24 15	
Hydrated lime §205.603	TF	1995 TAP	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	Rescheduled for 02 24 15	
Hydrogen peroxide §205.603	CW	Y (for Crops 205.601(a))	TR for Crops expected Jan/Feb 2015	Rescheduled for 02 24 15	
Iodine 205.603(a)(14) and 205.603 (b)(2)	JR	1994 TAP <a href="#">2015 TR</a>	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 01 07 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found sufficient 01 20 15	01 20 15 and 01 27 15	
Mineral oil §205.603	PD	2002 TR Y	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	02 17 15	
Vitamins §205.603	CW	Y Lmtd scope	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	Rescheduled for 02 24 15	

2017 Sunsets (No TRs) Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015					
Substance	Contact	New TR reqst?	Notes	Discussed	Meeting
Aspirin §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015
Atropine §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		02 17 15	
Butorphanol §205.603	CBo	2002 TR Y	New TR requested. Not contracted.	Rescheduled for 02 24 15	
Calcium hypochlorite §205.603	FT/ <del>JD</del>	N (06 17)		01 06 15 and 01 27 15	
Chlorine dioxide	FT/ <del>JD</del>	N (06 17)		01 06 15 and 01 27 15	
EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern §205.603	TF	N (06 03)	TR for NPEs sent to CS 01 30 15. No action by LS needed.	02 17 15	

Flunixin §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		02 17 15	
Formic Acid §205.603	CBo	N (06 17)		02 17 15	
Furosemide §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		02 17 15	
Glucose §205.603	CW	N (07 01)		01 20 15	
Glycerine §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		02 17 15	
Lidocaine §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Magnesium hydroxide §205.603	TF	N		02 17 15	
Magnesium sulfate §205.603	TF	N		02 17 15	
Methionine §205.603	TF	N		02 17 15	
Oxytocin §205.603	CW	N (07 01)		01 20 15	
Peracetic acid §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Phosphoric acid §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Poloxalene §205.603	FT	N		02 02 15	
Procaine §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Sodium hypochlorite §205.603	FT/JD	N (06 17)		01 06 15 and 01 27 15	
Strychnine 205.604	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Sucrose octanoate esters §205.603	FT	N		02 02 15	
Trace minerals §205.603	FT	N		02 02 15	
Vaccines §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Tolazoline §205.603	FT	2002 TR Y	New TR requested. Not contracted.	02 02 15	
Xylazine §205.603	CBo	2002 TR Y	New TR requested. Not contracted.	02 17 15	

### Other projects

Project	Contact	TR Reqst?	Notes	Vote	Meeting
AQ Review Legacy summary	TF		Summary of the AQ review to date.	Scheduled for 02 24	Disc Doc Spr 2015

\* **Yellow highlight** indicates committee action needed

## Agenda

- Approve notes from February 2, 2015
- 2017 sunsets (CW). Discuss TR sufficiency (if TR is back) or possible questions - Electrolytes, hydrogen peroxide, Vitamins
- 2017 sunsets (FT). Discuss TR sufficiency - Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin.
- 2017 sunsets (FT). Discuss TR sufficiency/continue discussion about questions - Chlorhexidine
- 2017 sunsets (JR). Discuss TR sufficiency (if TR was received) - Excipients
- 2017 sunsets (PD). Discuss TR sufficiency (if TR was received) - Mineral oil. 2017 sunsets (CBo). Discuss summaries - Butorphanol, Formic Acid, Xylazine
- 2017 sunsets (TF). Discuss TR sufficiency - Hydrated lime
- 2017 sunsets: Copper sulfate (TF). Discuss TR sufficiency.
- 2017 sunsets (TF). Discuss summaries - Atropine, EPA List 4 Inerts, Flunixin, Furosemide, Glycerine, Magnesium hydroxide, Magnesium sulfate, Methionine
- Zinc Sulfate - discuss TR/checklist
- MET- discuss proposal/vote
- Adjourn

## Discussion

- **Notes from** February 2, 2015 were approved with some minor clarifications to the future schedule.
- **2017 sunsets (CW). Electrolytes, hydrogen peroxide, Vitamins. No TR yet.** Will defer conversation to next call.
- **2017 sunsets (FT). Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin.** No TRs yet. Will defer conversation to next call.
- **2017 sunsets (FT). Chlorhexidine.** The group finalized the discussion about usage and will add questions pertaining to this
- **2017 sunsets (CBo). Excipients.** 205.603(f). Category of excipients is large and complex. The materials under the excipients umbrella that are allowed in organic are those that are FDA approved. The NOP noted that there are thousands of excipients and it is not realistic for the NOSB to review each one individually. The lead feels that the TR could influence the type of questions the LS would ask.
- **2017 sunsets (PD). Mineral oil.** Topical lubricant. TR is in development. The LS will add questions to seek info about compatibility and alternatives.
- **2017 sunsets (CBo). Butorphanol:** Used as a pain medication. The group discussed the use of this material during gestation, and the NOP noted that the label may already restrict the administration of these drugs during pregnancy. The LS will continue the discussion on the next call about potential questions for the posting.
- **2017 sunsets (CBo). Formic Acid:** For use within honeybee hives. Synthetic. Less toxic than other methods. The LS will add questions for posting.
- **2017 sunsets (CBo). Xylazine:** Xylazine was reviewed in combination with Tolazoline as they are used together. The LS will add several questions regarding alternatives.
- **2017 sunsets (TF). Hydrated lime.** TR sufficiency discussion deferred to next call
- **2017 sunsets (TF). Copper sulfate.** The lead briefly summarized the TR. It was found it sufficient and the LS will discuss the summary on next call.

- **2017 sunsets (TF).** Will add questions to some of the summaries for posting.
  - **Atropine** - Federal law restricts use by lawful written or oral order of a licensed veterinarian. A 2003 NOSB recommendation found it safe and compatible with a system of organic livestock production. The LS will add questions for public comment, regarding use as pre-anesthesia and eye treatments.
  - **EPA List 4 Inerts** - Complex and large topic. The NOSB will be working with the EPA's Design for the Environment (DfE) and NOP to move this forward. There is a webinar scheduled for the end of March and the EPA will also present at the spring 2015 NOSB meeting.
  - **Flunixin.** The LS will add a question about essentiality and implications if it is removed.
  - **Furosemide.** No additional questions
  - **Glycerine.** Allowed as a livestock teat dip, must be produced through hydrolysis of fats or oils. No additional questions
  - **Magnesium hydroxide.** Currently listed with extensive restrictive annotation. No additional questions.
  - **Magnesium sulfate.** This material has a number of veterinary uses. No additional questions.
  - **Methionine** - Feed additive. MET was also petitioned and the LS is bringing for a proposal to the spring meeting. The LS will include a question in the sunset posting asking about the impacts of the annotation that they are proposing.
- **Zinc Sulfate** - discuss TR/checklist - Deferred to next call
- **MET**- finalize proposal/vote

Motion to accept the proposal on MET.

DL–Methionine, DL–Methionine—hydroxy analog, and DL–Methionine—hydroxy analog calcium (CAS #'s 59-51-8, 583-91-5, 4857-44-7, and 922-50-9)—for use only in organic poultry production at the following pounds of synthetic 100% Methionine per ton of feed in the diet, averaged over the life of the flock: Laying chickens – 2 pounds; Broiler chickens – 2.5 pounds; Turkeys and all other poultry – 3 pounds.

Motion by: TF

Seconded by: JR

Additional Discussion: AS stated that she uses this product and she, as well as the rest of the Subcommittee and the NOP, feels this does not constitute a Conflict of Interest

Yes: 6 No: 2 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

Motion carries

Motion to accept the following resolution: The National Organic Standards Board is committed to the phase-out of synthetic methionine for organic poultry production, and encourages aggressive research on natural sources of methionine, as well as research into breeding poultry that perform well on less methionine.

Motion by: TF

Seconded by: CBo

Yes: 8 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

Motion carries

CBo will add a minority opinion to the proposal, and will send to the Chair by Friday, Feb 20

- **The meeting was adjourned**

### **Previous LS Notes**

#### **Future Call Schedule:**

**Feb 2, 2015 3:00 ET.** Note: this is a Monday

- MET- discuss proposal if more discussion is needed/vote
- 2017 sunsets (CW). Discuss TR sufficiency (if TR is back) or possible questions – Electrolytes, hydrogen peroxide, vitamins
- 2017 sunsets (FT). Discuss TR sufficiency - Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin. Discuss summaries - Poloxalene, Sucrose octanoate esters, Trace minerals, Tolazoline
- 2017 sunsets (FT). Discuss TR sufficiency/questions- Chlorhexidine
- 2017 sunsets (CBo). Discuss TR sufficiency - Excipients, Mineral oil. Discuss summaries - Butorphanol, Formic Acid, Xylazine
- 2017 sunsets (TF). Discuss TR sufficiency - Hydrated lime
- 2017 sunsets: Copper sulfate (TF). Discuss TR sufficiency (if TR is returned)

**Feb 17, 2015 3:00 ET**

- 2017 sunsets (CW). Discuss TR sufficiency (if TR is back) or possible questions - Electrolytes, hydrogen peroxide, Vitamins. Deferred to next call
- 2017 sunsets (FT). Discuss TR sufficiency - Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin. Deferred to next call
- 2017 sunsets (FT). Continue discussion of Tolazoline. Completed Feb 2
- 2017 sunsets (FT). Discuss TR sufficiency/continue discussion about questions – Chlorhexidine. Completed
- 2017 sunsets (JR). Discuss TR sufficiency (if TR was received) – Excipients.
- 2017 sunsets (PD). Discuss TR sufficiency (if TR was received) - Mineral oil - Completed
- 2017 sunsets (CBo). Discuss summaries - Butorphanol, Formic Acid, Xylazine - Completed (will continue Butorphanol on next call)
- 2017 sunsets (TF). Discuss TR sufficiency - Hydrated lime. Deferred to next call
- 2017 sunsets: Copper sulfate (TF). Discuss TR sufficiency. Deferred to next call
- 2017 sunsets (TF). Discuss summaries - completed
  - Atropine.
  - EPA List 4 Inerts
  - Flunixin
  - Furosemide
  - Glycerine
  - Magnesium hydroxide
  - Magnesium sulfate
  - Methionine
- Zinc Sulfate - discuss TR/checklist. Deferred to next call
- MET- discuss proposal/vote- completed

**Feb 24, 2015 3:00 ET**

- 2017 sunsets (CBo). Butorphanol. Continue discussion of questions for summary.
- 2017 sunsets (TF). Discuss TR sufficiency - Hydrated lime.
- 2017 sunsets (CW). Discuss TR sufficiency (if TR is back) or possible questions - Electrolytes, hydrogen peroxide, Vitamins
- 2017 sunsets (FT). Discuss TR sufficiency - Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin.
- AQ legacy doc follow-up discussion and vote (TF). Vote



- 2017 sunsets (JR). Excipients Discuss TR sufficiency (if TR was received)
- 2017 sunsets: Copper sulfate (TF). Discuss summary.
- Zinc Sulfate - discuss TR/checklist

**Mar 3, 2015 3:00 ET**

**Mar 17, 2015 3:00 ET**

**Apr 7, 2015 3:00 ET**

**Apr 21, 2015 3:00 ET**

<b>Spring 2015 Milestones</b>	<b>Target date</b>
NOSB Training	Feb 4-5, 2015
NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2015
NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP	Feb 25, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 9, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 13, 2015
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg)	Apr 10, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 13, 2015
Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA	Week of April 27 - 30

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting Notes  
Tuesday, February 24, 2015 3:00pm ET**

**Attending:** Tracy Favre, Chair (TF); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Ashley Swaffar (AS); Francis Thicke (FT); Paula Daniels (PD); Calvin Walker, Vice Chair (CW); Jean Richardson (JR); Harold Austin (HA) - sitting in

**Absent:** Mac Stone (MS)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

**Work Agenda**

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Vote	Meeting
<a href="#">Methionine in organic poultry feed (MET)-petitioned</a>	205.603	MS	<a href="#">2011 TR</a>	Petition recv'd 04 08 2011 TR received 11 15 11	02 17 15	Proposal Spr 2015
<a href="#">Acidified Sodium chlorite (ASC) Petition Addendum #1 Petition Addendum #2</a>	205.603 (a)(b)	JD/FT	<a href="#">2008 TR</a> <a href="#">2013 TR</a>	Petition sent to LS 06 12 12. Petition found sufficient 09 18. TR requested on 09 18 12. TR sent to LS 05 08 13. TR found suff 07 30 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled. Spring 2014 sent back to LS.	01 27 15	Proposal Spr 2015
<a href="#">Aluminum Sulfate (PDF)</a>	205.603	JR	Y	The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015.		Proposal Fall 2015
<a href="#">Sodium Bisulfate</a>	205.603	JR	Y	Petition sent to LS 05 27 14. Q's for petitioner/TR request due 07 28 14. TR request sent to NOP 08 06 14. TR expected Jan 2015.		TBD
<a href="#">Zinc Sulfate</a>	205.603	TF	<a href="#">2015</a>	Petition sent to LS 06 16 14. Q's for petitioner/TR request due 8 19 14. Limited Scope TR request sent to NOP 08 06 14. TR expected mid-Jan 2015. TR sent to LS 02 09 15. Suff due 04 10 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	02 24 15	Fall 2015

<a href="#">Aquaculture-CO<sub>2</sub></a> , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Chlorine</a> (for aquatic plants)	205.609	JD/FT	<a href="#">2011 Crops TR</a> <a href="#">2006 TR</a> <a href="#">1995 TAP</a>	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Micronutrients</a> (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	<a href="#">2010 TR (Nickel)</a> <a href="#">6/2013 Minerals TR</a>	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants)</a> (for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	<a href="#">2/2011 Crops TR</a>  <a href="#">7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR</a>	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Vitamins (B1, B12, H)</a> for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	<a href="#">4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR</a>	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD

<a href="#">Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals</a>	205.611	JR	<a href="#">2011 TR</a> (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture - Chlorine</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	JÐ/FT	No <a href="#">Crops 2011</a> <a href="#">Crops 2006</a> <a href="#">Crops 1995</a> <a href="#">Livestock 2006</a> <a href="#">Handling 2006</a>	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture – Tocopherols</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	<a href="#">2013 TR</a> <a href="#">1995 TAP</a> <a href="#">rvw</a>	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture – Vitamins</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes <a href="#">2013 TR</a>	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with Minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture - Trace Minerals</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	<a href="#">2013 TR</a>	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

2017 Sunsets TR Requests Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015					
Substance	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Summary discussion	Meeting
Ethanol §205.603	TF	Y	Draft TR sent to LS 09 24 14. Suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 01 06 15	01 27 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015
Isopropanol §205.603	CW	Y	Draft TR sent to LS 09 24 14. Suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 01 06 15	01 06 15	
Chlorhexidine §205.603	JÐ/FT/ CW	2010 TR Y	TR requested 08 15 14. TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 02 26 15. Suff due 03 06 15	02 02 15	

Copper sulfate §205.603	TF	1995 TAP <a href="#">2015 Lmtd Scope</a>	TR in development (expected Dec 2014). TR sent to LS 02 13 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	02 24 15	
Electrolytes §205.603	CW	1995 TAP	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	02 24 15	
Excipients §205.603	CBe/JR	Y	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 02 26 15. Suff due 03 06 15	02 24 15	
Fenbendazole §205.603	FT	1999 TR Y	Combined with other paraciticides (Moxidectin and Ivermectin). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	02 24 15	
Ivermectin §205.603	FT	1999 TR Y	Combined with other paraciticides (Fendbendazole and Moxidectin). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	02 24 15	
Moxidectin §205.603	FT	2003 TR Y	Combined with other paraciticides (Fendbendazole and Ivermectin). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	02 24 15	
Hydrated lime §205.603(b)	TF	1995 TAP	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	02 24 15	
Hydrogen peroxide §205.603(a)	CW	Y (for Crops 205.601(a))	TR for Crops expected Jan/Feb 2015	02 24 15	
Iodine 205.603(a)(14) and 205.603(b)(2)	JR	1994 TAP <a href="#">2015 TR</a>	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 01 07 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found sufficient 01 20 15	01 20 15 and 01 27 15	
Mineral oil §205.603	PD	2002 TR Y	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	02 17 15	
Vitamins §205.603(d)	CW	Y Lmtd scope	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	02 24 15	

2017 Sunsets (No TRs) Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015					
Substance	Contact	New TR reqst?	Notes	Discussed	Meeting
Aspirin §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015
Atropine §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		02 17 15	
Butorphanol §205.603	CBo	2002 TR Y	New TR requested. Not contracted.	02 24 15	
Calcium hypochlorite §205.603	FT/ <del>JR</del>	N (06 17)		01 06 15 and 01 27 15	
Chlorine dioxide	FT/ <del>JR</del>	N (06 17)		01 06 15 & 01 27 15	
EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern §205.603	TF	N (06 03)	TR for NPEs sent to CS 01 30 15. No action by LS needed.	02 17 15	

Flunixin §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		02 17 15	
Formic Acid §205.603	CBo	N (06 17)		02 17 15	
Furosemide §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		02 17 15	
Glucose §205.603	CW	N (07 01)		01 20 15	
Glycerine §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		02 17 15	
Lidocaine §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Magnesium hydroxide §205.603	TF	N		02 17 15	
Magnesium sulfate §205.603	TF	N		02 17 15	
Methionine §205.603	TF	N		02 17 15	
Oxytocin §205.603	CW	N (07 01)		01 20 15	
Peracetic acid §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Phosphoric acid §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Poloxalene §205.603	FT	N		02 02 15	
Procaine §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Sodium hypochlorite §205.603	FT/JD	N (06 17)		01 06 15 and 01 27 15	
Strychnine 205.604	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Sucrose octanoate esters §205.603	FT	N		02 02 15	
Trace minerals §205.603	FT	N		02 02 15	
Vaccines §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Tolazoline §205.603	FT	2002 TR Y	New TR requested. Not contracted.	02 02 15	
Xylazine §205.603	CBo	2002 TR Y	New TR requested. Not contracted.	02 17 15	

### Other projects

Project	Contact	TR Reqst?	Notes	Vote	Meeting
AQ Review Legacy summary	TF		Summary of the AQ review to date.	02 24 15	Report Spr 2015

\* **Yellow highlight** indicates committee action needed

## Agenda

- Approve notes from February 17, 2015
- 2017 sunsets (CBo). Butorphanol. Continue discussion of questions for summary.
- 2017 sunsets (TF). Discuss TR sufficiency - Hydrated lime.
- 2017 sunsets (CW). Discuss TR sufficiency (if TR is back) or possible questions - Electrolytes, hydrogen peroxide, Vitamins
- 2017 sunsets (FT). Discuss TR sufficiency - Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin.
- AQ legacy doc follow-up discussion and vote (TF). Vote
- 2017 sunsets (JR). Excipients Discuss TR sufficiency (if TR was received)
- 2017 sunsets: Copper sulfate (TF). Discuss summary.
- Zinc Sulfate (TF) - discuss TR/checklist
- Adjourn

## Discussion

- **Notes from** February 17, 2015 were approved with one clarification to the notes about Tolazoline/Xylazine.
- **2017 sunsets (CBo). Butorphanol.** LS will add several questions to the posting.
- **2017 sunsets (TF). Hydrated lime.** Waiting for TR. There are some environmental concerns about soil compaction and inhalation.
- **2017 sunsets (CW). Electrolytes, hydrogen peroxide, Vitamins.** The summaries are completed but the LS is waiting for TRs. It is likely that the summary for electrolytes will be modified based on the information in the TR.
- **2017 sunsets (FT). Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin.** The summaries were circulated previously and the discussion was deferred to this call while waiting for the TR. The TR has not yet been received. The members discussed the summary and will pose some questions.
- **AQ legacy doc.** A member provided a separate document in which historical public comment was compiled. LS members asked for clarification about the source of these data. The lead author noted that the information was collected from Regulations.gov and past meeting transcripts. The LS Chair feels that a paragraph in the main document would be adequate to capture the sense of public comment. Most members agreed that it would be representative and including comprehensive tables was not necessary. The group reached an agreement to include the tables as links in the document. The LS proceeded to a vote.

Motion to accept the AQ Legacy report

Motion by: CBo

Seconded by: JR

Additional Discussion: The group discussed the format of the document, which was changed from a discussion document to a report.

Yes: 7 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

Motion passed

- **2017 sunsets (JR). Excipients.** Waiting for TR. The lead proposed that they do not pose questions aside from the standard questions included in the introduction. The summary will

include a note that the TR is in development. The members briefly mentioned the suitability of the current annotation.

- **2017 sunsets - Copper sulfate (TF).** Used in walk-through footbaths used to help control and prevent hoof related diseases in dairy cattle and sheep. Often used in combination with zinc sulfate. Members discussed environmental concerns for soil and plants in comparison with zinc. Copper sulfate is not used routinely, and there are organic management practices in place to mitigate soil degradation, therefore this is not likely something that will become an issue. NOP noted that the crops annotation would apply if the waste material is disposed of on certified land. The LS will add a question for public comment regarding disposal and fate in soil.
- **Zinc Sulfate (TF). Members discussed the petition for zinc sulfate, as well as the TR, checklist and proposal. The LS proceeded to a vote.**

Motion to classify zinc sulfate as petitioned as synthetic

Motion by: TF

Seconded by: JR

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 7 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

Motion passed

Motion to add zinc sulfate for use as a footbath only on to 205.603

Motion by: TF

Seconded by: CW

Additional Discussion: Several members were interested in gleaning more info for public comment in the interim.

Yes: 4 No: 3 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

Motion passed

- **MET conversation** - After much discussion and consideration, the Chair decided to allow the inclusion of the minority opinion as a separate document even though it had not been introduced to the entire Livestock Subcommittee in time for members to familiarize themselves with it. Two Subcommittee members expressed the views that the writing of the minority opinion was in accordance to the current NOSB Policy and Procedures Manual. Another member expressed the view that issues should be voted upon early enough to allow sufficient time for a minority opinion to be written, if one is to be written. The Chair noted that while she respects and supports the right to include a minority opinion, it was not respectful to the rest of the Livestock Subcommittee for the minority to introduce a document after the Subcommittee had already voted on the proposal. The Chair noted that this will not be allowed in the future. One member expressed support and understanding for the Chair's decision to allow this document, but felt that this process was not reflective of the appropriate NOSB procedures and practice. Another member expressed discomfort with the lack of discussion of the extensive minority opinion and the new information it contains.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

**Future Call Schedule:**



**Feb 17, 2015 3:00 ET**

- 2017 sunsets (CW). Discuss TR sufficiency (if TR is back) or possible questions - Electrolytes, hydrogen peroxide, Vitamins. Deferred to next call
- 2017 sunsets (FT). Discuss TR sufficiency - Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin. Deferred to next call
- 2017 sunsets (FT). Continue discussion of Tolazoline. Completed Feb 2
- 2017 sunsets (FT). Discuss TR sufficiency/continue discussion about questions – Chlorhexidine. Completed
  - 2017 sunsets (JR). Discuss TR sufficiency (if TR was received) – Excipients.
  - 2017 sunsets (PD). Discuss TR sufficiency (if TR was received) - Mineral oil - Completed
  - 2017 sunsets (CBo). Discuss summaries - Butorphanol, Formic Acid, Xylazine - Completed (will continue Butorphanol on next call)
  - 2017 sunsets (TF). Discuss TR sufficiency - Hydrated lime. Deferred to next call
  - 2017 sunsets: Copper sulfate (TF). Discuss TR sufficiency. Deferred to next call
- 2017 sunsets (TF). Discuss summaries - completed
  - Atropine.
  - EPA List 4 Inerts
  - Flunixin
  - Furosemide
  - Glycerine
  - Magnesium hydroxide
  - Magnesium sulfate
  - Methionine
- Zinc Sulfate - discuss TR/checklist. Deferred to next call
- MET- discuss proposal/vote- completed

**Feb 24, 2015 3:00 ET**

- 2017 sunsets (CBo). Butorphanol. Continue discussion of questions for summary.
- 2017 sunsets (TF). Discuss TR sufficiency - Hydrated lime.
- 2017 sunsets (CW). Discuss TR sufficiency (if TR is back) or possible questions - Electrolytes, hydrogen peroxide, Vitamins
- 2017 sunsets (FT). Discuss TR sufficiency - Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin.
- AQ legacy doc follow-up discussion and vote (TF). Vote
- 2017 sunsets (JR). Excipients Discuss TR sufficiency (if TR was received)
- 2017 sunsets: Copper sulfate (TF). Discuss summary.
- Zinc Sulfate (TF) - discuss TR/checklist

**Mar 3, 2015 3:00 ET**

**Mar 17, 2015 3:00 ET**

**Apr 7, 2015 3:00 ET**

**Apr 21, 2015 3:00 ET**

Spring 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOSB Training	Feb 4-5, 2015
NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2015
NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP	Feb 25, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 9, 2015

Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 13, 2015
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg)	Apr 10, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 13, 2015
Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA	Week of April 27 - 30

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting Notes  
Tuesday, March 3, 2015 3:00pm ET**

**Attending:** Tracy Favre, Chair (TF); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Ashley Swaffar (AS); Calvin Walker, Vice Chair (CW); Jean Richardson (JR); Francis Thicke (FT); Harold Austin (HA) - sitting in

**Absent:** Mac Stone (MS); Paula Daniels (PD)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

**Work Agenda**

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Vote	Meeting
<a href="#">Methionine in organic poultry feed (MET)-petitioned</a>	205.603	MS	<a href="#">2011 TR</a>	Petition recv'd 04 08 2011 TR received 11 15 11	02 17 15	Proposal Spr 2015
<a href="#">Acidified Sodium chlorite (ASC) Petition Addendum #1 Petition Addendum #2</a>	205.603 (a)(b)	JD/FT	<a href="#">2008 TR</a> <a href="#">2013 TR</a>	Petition sent to LS 06 12 12. Petition found sufficient 09 18. TR requested on 09 18 12. TR sent to LS 05 08 13. TR found suff 07 30 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled. Spring 2014 sent back to LS.	01 27 15	Proposal Spr 2015
<a href="#">Aluminum Sulfate (PDF)</a>	205.603	JR	Y	The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015.		Proposal Fall 2015
<a href="#">Sodium Bisulfate</a>	205.603	JR	Y	Petition sent to LS 05 27 14. Q's for petitioner/TR request due 07 28 14. TR request sent to NOP 08 06 14. TR expected Jan 2015.		TBD
<a href="#">Zinc Sulfate</a>	205.603	TF	<a href="#">2015</a>	Petition sent to LS 06 16 14. Q's for petitioner/TR request due 8 19 14. Limited Scope TR request sent to NOP 08 06 14. TR expected mid-Jan 2015. TR sent to LS 02 09 15. Suff due 04 10 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	02 24 15	Fall 2015

<a href="#">Aquaculture-CO<sub>2</sub></a> , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Chlorine</a> (for aquatic plants)	205.609	JD/FT	<a href="#">2011 Crops TR</a>  <a href="#">2006 TR</a>  <a href="#">1995 TAP</a>	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Micronutrients</a> (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	<a href="#">2010 TR (Nickel)</a>  <a href="#">6/2013 Minerals TR</a>	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants)</a> (for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	<a href="#">2/2011 Crops TR</a>  <a href="#">7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR</a>	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Vitamins (B1, B12, H)</a> for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	<a href="#">4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR</a>	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD

<a href="#">Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals</a>	205.611	JR	<a href="#">2011 TR</a> (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture - Chlorine</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	JR/FT	No <a href="#">Crops 2011</a> <a href="#">Crops 2006</a> <a href="#">Crops 1995</a> <a href="#">Livestock 2006</a> <a href="#">Handling 2006</a>	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture – Tocopherols</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	<a href="#">2013 TR</a> <a href="#">1995 TAP</a> <a href="#">rvw</a>	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture – Vitamins</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes <a href="#">2013 TR</a>	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with Minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture - Trace Minerals</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	<a href="#">2013 TR</a>	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

2017 Sunsets TR Requests Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015					
Substance	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Summary discussion	Meeting
Ethanol §205.603	TF	Y	Draft TR sent to LS 09 24 14. Suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 01 06 15	01 27 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015
Isopropanol §205.603	CW	Y	Draft TR sent to LS 09 24 14. Suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 01 06 15	01 06 15	

Chlorhexidine §205.603	JÐ/FT/ CW	2010 TR <a href="#">2015 TR</a>	TR requested 08 15 14. TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 02 26 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 03 15.	02 02 15	
Copper sulfate §205.603	TF	1995 TAP <a href="#">2015 Lmtd Scope</a>	TR in development (expected Dec 2014). TR sent to LS 02 13 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	02 24 15	
Electrolytes §205.603	CW	1995 TAP	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	02 24 15	
Excipients §205.603	CBe/JR	<a href="#">2015</a>	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 02 26 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 03 15.	02 24 15	
Fenbendazole §205.603	FT	1999 TR Y	Combined with other paraciticides (Moxidectin and Ivermectin). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	02 24 15	
Ivermectin §205.603	FT	1999 TR Y	Combined with other paraciticides (Fendbendazole and Moxidectin). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	02 24 15	
Moxidectin §205.603	FT	2003 TR Y	Combined with other paraciticides (Fendbendazole and Ivermectin). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	02 24 15	
Hydrated lime §205.603(b)	TF	1995 TAP	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	02 24 15	
Hydrogen peroxide §205.603(a)	CW	Y (for Crops 205.601(a))	TR for Crops expected Jan/Feb 2015	02 24 15	
Iodine 205.603(a)(14) and 205.603(b)(2)	JR	1994 TAP <a href="#">2015 TR</a>	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 01 07 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found sufficient 01 20 15	01 20 15 and 01 27 15	
Mineral oil §205.603	PD	2002 TR Y	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	02 17 15	
Vitamins §205.603(d)	CW	Y Lmtd scope	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	02 24 15	

### 2017 Sunsets (No TRs) Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015

Substance	Contact	New TR reqst?	Notes	Discussed	Meeting
Aspirin §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015
Atropine §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		02 17 15	
Butorphanol §205.603	CBo	2002 TR Y	New TR requested. Not contracted.	02 24 15	
Calcium hypochlorite §205.603	FT/JÐ	N (06 17)		01 06 15 and 01 27 15	

Chlorine dioxide	FT/ <del>JD</del>	N (06 17)		01 06 15 & 01 27 15	
EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern §205.603	TF	N (06 03)	TR for NPEs sent to CS 01 30 15. No action by LS needed.	02 17 15	
Flunixin §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		02 17 15	
Formic Acid §205.603	CBo	N (06 17)		02 17 15	
Furosemide §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		02 17 15	
Glucose §205.603	CW	N (07 01)		01 20 15	
Glycerine §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		02 17 15	
Lidocaine §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Magnesium hydroxide §205.603	TF	N		02 17 15	
Magnesium sulfate §205.603	TF	N		02 17 15	
Methionine §205.603	TF	N		02 17 15	
Oxytocin §205.603	CW	N (07 01)		01 20 15	
Peracetic acid §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Phosphoric acid §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Poloxalene §205.603	FT	N		02 02 15	
Procaine §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Sodium hypochlorite §205.603	FT/JD	N (06 17)		01 06 15 and 01 27 15	
Strychnine 205.604	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Sucrose octanoate esters §205.603	FT	N		02 02 15	
Trace minerals §205.603	FT	N		02 02 15	
Vaccines §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Tolazoline §205.603	FT	2002 TR Y	New TR requested. Not contracted.	02 02 15	
Xylazine §205.603	CBo	2002 TR Y	New TR requested. Not contracted.	02 17 15	

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst?	Notes	Vote	Meeting
AQ Review Legacy summary	TF		Summary of the AQ review to date.	02 24 15	Report Spr 2015

\* **Yellow highlight** indicates committee action needed

### Agenda

- Approve notes from February 24, 2015
- 2017 Sunset - Excipients. TR sufficiency and discussion
- Work plan for Fall 2015 Meeting 2 templates and proposals
- Research Priorities - Development timeline for fall 2015 meeting
- Public comments for the Spring 2015 meeting
- Aquaculture petitioned materials.
- Adjourn

### Discussion

- **Notes from** February 24, 2015 were not available for review
- **2017 sunset - Excipients (JR)**. The LS discussed the TR, which was very comprehensive and found it sufficient. The LS Chair recommended that others read it as well, and consider that there are 8000 materials that qualify as excipients.
- **Spring meeting wrap up**. Members discussed the MET minority report and verified that this is the final document that will be posted along with the MET proposal for the spring meeting.
- **2017 sunset - Chlorhexidine (FT)** - The TR was found sufficient. CW let the group know that he sent an email to the FDA on behalf of the lead reviewer asking about teat dips and approved animal drugs. The NOP clarified that most of the teat dips are considered unapproved animal drugs, and although not registered as a drug, the FDA also does not view them as a concern. NOP also informed the LS that the FDA maintains a registry for non-approved animal drugs.
- **Work plan for fall 2015**. Meeting 2 templates and proposals. The templates will be provided to the Subcommittee members in Word version and the LS will schedule discussions for the summer.
- **Public comments**. The LS Chair asked that members review any public comment for their specific materials in preparation for the spring meeting.
- Aquaculture petitioned materials. Since the draft aquaculture rule will not be published until later this year, it is not likely the LS will work on any of the materials in calendar year 2015.
- Research Priorities. The LS Chair, along with the NOSB Chair and others, met with a representative from NIFA in DC in February to talk about the NOSB research priorities. She noted the need to be more proactive about discussing research priorities for the fall 2015 NOSB meeting. A discussion was scheduled for May 19
- **The meeting was adjourned**

### [Previous LS Notes](#)

#### Future Call Schedule:

Feb 24, 2015 3:00 ET

- 2017 sunsets (CBo). Butorphanol. Continue discussion of questions for summary.



- 2017 sunsets (TF). Discuss TR sufficiency - Hydrated lime.
- 2017 sunsets (CW). Discuss TR sufficiency (if TR is back) or possible questions - Electrolytes, hydrogen peroxide, Vitamins
- 2017 sunsets (FT). Discuss TR sufficiency - Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin.
- AQ legacy doc follow-up discussion and vote (TF). Vote
- 2017 sunsets (JR). Excipients Discuss TR sufficiency (if TR was received)
- 2017 sunsets: Copper sulfate (TF). Discuss summary.
- Zinc Sulfate (TF) - discuss TR/checklist

**Mar 3, 2015 3:00 ET**

**Mar 17, 2015 3:00 ET**

Discuss who will present what at the spring meeting.

Schedule the discussion of the 2017 materials for the second posting.

Discuss public comment

**Apr 7, 2015 3:00 ET**

**Apr 21, 2015 3:00 ET**

**May 5, 2015** cancelled.

**May 19, 2015**

Research Priorities discussion

Spring 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOSB Training	Feb 4-5, 2015
NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2015
NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP	Feb 25, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 9, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 13, 2015
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg)	Apr 10, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 13, 2015
Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA	Week of April 27 - 30

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting Notes  
Tuesday, March 17, 2015 3:00pm ET**

**Attending:** Tracy Favre, Chair (TF); Jean Richardson (JR); Francis Thicke (FT); Paula Daniels (PD); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Calvin Walker, Vice Chair (CW); Harold Austin (HA) - sitting in

**Absent:** Mac Stone (MS); Ashley Swaffar (AS)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

**Work Agenda**

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Vote	Meeting
<a href="#">Methionine in organic poultry feed (MET)-petitioned</a>	205.603	MS	<a href="#">2011 TR</a>	Petition recv'd 04 08 2011 TR received 11 15 11	02 17 15	Proposal Spr 2015
<a href="#">Acidified Sodium chlorite (ASC) Petition Addendum #1 Petition Addendum #2</a>	205.603 (a)(b)	JD/FT	<a href="#">2008 TR</a> <a href="#">2013 TR</a>	Petition sent to LS 06 12 12. Petition found sufficient 09 18. TR requested on 09 18 12. TR sent to LS 05 08 13. TR found suff 07 30 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled. Spring 2014 sent back to LS.	01 27 15	Proposal Spr 2015
<a href="#">Aluminum Sulfate (PDF)</a>	205.603	JR	Y	The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015.		Proposal Fall 2015
<a href="#">Sodium Bisulfate</a>	205.603	JR	Y	Petition sent to LS 05 27 14. Q's for petitioner/TR request due 07 28 14. TR request sent to NOP 08 06 14. TR expected Jan 2015.		TBD
<a href="#">Zinc Sulfate</a>	205.603	TF	<a href="#">2015</a>	Petition sent to LS 06 16 14. Q's for petitioner/TR request due 8 19 14. Limited Scope TR request sent to NOP 08 06 14. TR expected mid-Jan 2015. TR sent to LS 02 09 15. Suff due 04 10 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	02 24 15	Fall 2015

<a href="#">Aquaculture-CO<sub>2</sub></a> , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Chlorine</a> (for aquatic plants)	205.609	JD/FT	<a href="#">2011 Crops TR</a>  <a href="#">2006 TR</a>  <a href="#">1995 TAP</a>	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Micronutrients</a> (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	<a href="#">2010 TR (Nickel)</a>  <a href="#">6/2013 Minerals TR</a>	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants)</a> (for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	<a href="#">2/2011 Crops TR</a>    <a href="#">7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR</a>	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Vitamins (B1, B12, H)</a> for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	<a href="#">4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR</a>	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD

<a href="#">Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals</a>	205.611	JR	<a href="#">2011 TR</a> (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture - Chlorine</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	JR/FT	No <a href="#">Crops 2011</a> <a href="#">Crops 2006</a> <a href="#">Crops 1995</a> <a href="#">Livestock 2006</a> <a href="#">Handling 2006</a>	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture – Tocopherols</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	<a href="#">2013 TR</a> <a href="#">1995 TAP</a> <a href="#">rvw</a>	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture – Vitamins</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes <a href="#">2013 TR</a>	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with Minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture - Trace Minerals</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	<a href="#">2013 TR</a>	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

2017 Sunsets TR Requests Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015					
Substance	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Summary discussion	Meeting
Ethanol §205.603	TF	Y	Draft TR sent to LS 09 24 14. Suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 01 06 15	01 27 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015
Isopropanol §205.603	CW	Y	Draft TR sent to LS 09 24 14. Suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 01 06 15	01 06 15	

Chlorhexidine §205.603	JF/FT/ CW	2010 TR Y	TR requested 08 15 14. TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 02 26 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 03 15.	02 02 15	
Copper sulfate §205.603	TF	1995 TAP <a href="#">2015 Lmted Scope</a>	TR in development (expected Dec 2014). TR sent to LS 02 13 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	02 24 15	
Electrolytes §205.603	CW	1995 TAP	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 03 27 15. Suff due ASAP	02 24 15	
Excipients §205.603	CBo/JR	Y	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 02 26 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 03 15.	02 24 15	
Fenbendazole §205.603	FT	1999 TR Y	Combined with other paracitcides (Moxidectin and Ivermectin). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	02 24 15	
Ivermectin §205.603	FT	1999 TR Y	Combined with other paracitcides (Fendbendazole and Moxidectin). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	02 24 15	
Moxidectin §205.603	FT	2003 TR Y	Combined with other paracitcides (Fendbendazole and Ivermectin). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	02 24 15	
Hydrated lime §205.603(b)	TF	1995 TAP	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 03 27 15. Suff due ASAP	02 24 15	
Hydrogen peroxide §205.603(a)	CW	Y (for Crops 205.601(a))	TR for Crops expected Jan/Feb 2015	02 24 15	
Iodine 205.603(a)(14) and 205.603(b)(2)	JR	1994 TAP <a href="#">2015 TR</a>	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 01 07 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found sufficient 01 20 15	01 20 15 and 01 27 15	
Mineral oil §205.603	PD	2002 TR Y	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	02 17 15	
Vitamins §205.603(d)	CW	Y Lmtd scope	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	02 24 15	

**2017 Sunsets (No TRs) Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015**

Substance	Contact	New TR reqst?	Notes	Discussed	Meeting
Aspirin §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015
Atropine §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		02 17 15	
Butorphanol §205.603	CBo	2002 TR Y	New TR requested. Not contracted.	02 24 15	

Calcium hypochlorite §205.603	FT/ <del>JD</del>	N (06 17)		01 06 15 and 01 27 15	
Chlorine dioxide	FT/ <del>JD</del>	N (06 17)		01 06 15 & 01 27 15	
EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern §205.603	TF	N (06 03)	TR for NPEs sent to CS 01 30 15. No action by LS needed.	02 17 15	
Flunixin §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		02 17 15	
Formic Acid §205.603	CBo	N (06 17)		02 17 15	
Furosemide §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		02 17 15	
Glucose §205.603	CW	N (07 01)		01 20 15	
Glycerine §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		02 17 15	
Lidocaine §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Magnesium hydroxide §205.603	TF	N		02 17 15	
Magnesium sulfate §205.603	TF	N		02 17 15	
Methionine §205.603	TF	N		02 17 15	
Oxytocin §205.603	CW	N (07 01)		01 20 15	
Peracetic acid §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Phosphoric acid §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Poloxalene §205.603	FT	N		02 02 15	
Procaine §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Sodium hypochlorite §205.603	FT/JD	N (06 17)		01 06 15 and 01 27 15	
Strychnine 205.604	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Sucrose octanoate esters §205.603	FT	N		02 02 15	
Trace minerals §205.603	FT	N		02 02 15	
Vaccines §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Tolazoline §205.603	FT	2002 TR Y	New TR requested. Not contracted.	02 02 15	

Xylazine §205.603	CBo	2002 TR Y	New TR requested. Not contracted.	02 17 15	
-------------------	-----	--------------	-----------------------------------	----------	--

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst?	Notes	Vote	Meeting
AQ Review Legacy summary	TF		Summary of the AQ review to date.	02 24 15	Report Spr 2015

\* **Yellow highlight** indicates committee action needed

### Agenda

- Approve notes from the February 24 call if available
- Approve notes from the March 3 call if available
- TR sufficiency for Mineral Oil (PD)
- TR sufficiency for Vitamins (CW)
- Discuss Spring meeting presentations and discussion
- Scheduling discussion of Meeting 2 proposals
- Additional calls?
- Adjourn

### Discussion

- **Notes from the February 24 and March 3 call were not available for review yet.**
- **TR sufficiency for Mineral Oil (PD).** The lead found the TR was very informative and helpful, and noted that it was much more informative than the previous one.
- **TR sufficiency for Vitamins (CW).** The lead noted via email that he found the TR sufficient and the LS Chair agreed. Members discussed the issues around GM microorganisms used in production of vitamins, and discussed various options. Suggestions included having the Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee work on this issue, and letting the community and stakeholders drive the development of alternatives. A member expressed the opinion that NOSB needs to work on this issue due to stakeholder concerns. **Spring meeting presentations and discussion** - The LS expressed support for collaborating with other Subcommittees to make sure all of the sunset presentations are similar and uniform. Members discussed the best way to present the 2017 sunset materials given the large number of them. The consensus was that there should be a simple summary of the material along with the public comments. The LS Chair will draft some language for consistency and clarification and the members will discuss it on the next call.
- **Meeting 2 proposal discussions.** On April 7 the group will schedule discussions of the 2017 sunset reviews
- **Additional calls.** The LS will add several calls to the agenda to facilitate review of the sunset materials. See below for dates.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

### [Previous LS Notes](#)

#### Future Call Schedule:

Mar 3, 2015 3:00 ET

Mar 17, 2015 3:00 ET

Discuss who will present what at the spring meeting.  
 Schedule the discussions of the 2017 materials for the second posting.  
 Discuss public comment

**Apr 7, 2015 3:00 ET**

Assign discussions for 2017 sunsets  
 Discuss spring meeting presentations format

**Apr 21, 2015 3:00 ET**

**May 5, 2015** cancelled.

**May 19, 2015**

Discuss Research priorities.

**May 26, 2015 - additional call**

**June 2, 2015**

**June 16, 2015**

**June 23, 2015 - additional call**

**June 30, 2015 - additional call**

**July 7, 2015**

**July 21, 2015**

**July 28, 2015 - additional call**

**August 4, 2015**

**August 18, 2015**

**August 25, 2015 - additional call**

**September 1, 2015**

**September 15, 2015**

**October 6, 2015**

**October 20, 2015**

**November 3, 2015**

**November 17, 2015**

**December 1, 2015**

**December 15, 2015**

<b>Spring 2015 Milestones</b>	<b>Target date</b>
NOSB Training	Feb 4-5, 2015
NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2015
NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP	Feb 25, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 9, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 13, 2015
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg)	Apr 10, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 13, 2015
Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA	Week of April 27 - 30



Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting Notes  
Tuesday, April 7, 2015 3:00pm ET**

**Attending:** Tracy Favre, Chair (TF); Jean Richardson (JR); Francis Thicke (FT); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Calvin Walker, Vice Chair (CW); Ashley Swaffar (AS); Carmela Beck (CBe); Paula Daniels (PD); Tom Chapman (TC)

**Absent:** Mac Stone (MS)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

**Work Agenda**

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Vote	Meeting
<a href="#">Methionine in organic poultry feed (MET)-petitioned</a>	205.603	MS	<a href="#">2011 TR</a>	Petition recv'd 04 08 2011 TR received 11 15 11	02 17 15	Proposal Spr 2015
<a href="#">Acidified Sodium chlorite (ASC) Petition Addendum #1 Petition Addendum #2</a>	205.603 (a)(b)	JD/FT	<a href="#">2008 TR</a> <a href="#">2013 TR</a>	Petition sent to LS 06 12 12. Petition found sufficient 09 18. TR requested on 09 18 12. TR sent to LS 05 08 13. TR found suff 07 30 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled. Spring 2014 sent back to LS.	01 27 15	Proposal Spr 2015
<a href="#">Aluminum Sulfate (PDF)</a>	205.603	JR	Y	The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015.		Proposal Fall 2015
<a href="#">Sodium Bisulfate</a>	205.603	JR	Y	Petition sent to LS 05 27 14. Q's for petitioner/TR request due 07 28 14. TR request sent to NOP 08 06 14. TR expected Jan 2015.		TBD
<a href="#">Zinc Sulfate</a>	205.603	TF	<a href="#">2015</a>	Petition sent to LS 06 16 14. Q's for petitioner/TR request due 8 19 14. Limited Scope TR request sent to NOP 08 06 14. TR expected mid-Jan 2015. TR sent to LS 02 09 15. Suff due 04 10 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	02 24 15	Spr 2015



<a href="#">Aquaculture- Vitamins (B1, B12, H)</a> for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	<a href="#">4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR</a>	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals</a>	205.611	JR	<a href="#">2011 TR</a> (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture - Chlorine</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	JÐ/FT	No <a href="#">Crops 2011</a> <a href="#">Crops 2006</a> <a href="#">Crops 1995</a> <a href="#">Livestock 2006</a> <a href="#">Handling 2006</a>	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture – Tocopherols</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	<a href="#">2013 TR</a> <a href="#">1995 TAP</a> <a href="#">rvw</a>	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture – Vitamins</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes <a href="#">2013 TR</a>	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with Minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture - Trace Minerals</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	<a href="#">2013 TR</a>	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

2017 Sunsets TR Requests Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015					
Substance	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Summary discussion	Meeting
Ethanol §205.603	TF	Y	Draft TR sent to LS 09 24 14. Suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 01 06 15	01 27 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015

Isopropanol §205.603	CW	Y	Draft TR sent to LS 09 24 14. Suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 01 06 15	01 06 15	
Chlorhexidine §205.603	JD/FT/ CW	2010 TR Y	TR requested 08 15 14. TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 02 26 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 03 15.	02 02 15	
Copper sulfate §205.603	TF	1995 TAP <a href="#">2015 Lmtd Scope</a>	TR in development (expected Dec 2014). TR sent to LS 02 13 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	02 24 15	
Electrolytes §205.603	CW	1995 TAP 2015 TR	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 03 27 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 07 15	02 24 15	
Excipients §205.603	CE/JR	Y	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 02 26 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 03 15.	02 24 15	
Fenbendazole §205.603	FT	1999 TR Y	Combined with other paraciticides (Moxidectin and Ivermectin). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	02 24 15	
Ivermectin §205.603	FT	1999 TR Y	Combined with other paraciticides (Fendbendazole and Moxidectin). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	02 24 15	
Moxidectin §205.603	FT	2003 TR Y	Combined with other paraciticides (Fendbendazole and Ivermectin). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	02 24 15	
Hydrated lime §205.603(b)	TF	1995 TAP	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 03 27 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 07 15	02 24 15	
Hydrogen peroxide §205.603(a)	CW	Y (for Crops 205.601(a))	TR for Crops expected Jan/Feb 2015	02 24 15	
Iodine 205.603(a)(14) and 205.603(b)(2)	JR	1994 TAP <a href="#">2015 TR</a>	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 01 07 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found sufficient 01 20 15	01 20 15 and 01 27 15	
Mineral oil §205.603	PD	2002 TR <a href="#">2015 TR</a>	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	02 17 15	
Vitamins §205.603(d)	CW	<a href="#">2015 Lmtd scope</a>	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	02 24 15	

### 2017 Sunsets (No TRs) Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015

Substance	Contact	New TR reqst?	Notes	Discussed	Meeting
Aspirin §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015
Atropine §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		02 17 15	

Butorphanol §205.603	CBo	2002 TR Y	New TR requested. Not contracted.	02 24 15	
Calcium hypochlorite §205.603	FT/ <del>JD</del>	N (06 17)		01 06 15 and 01 27 15	
Chlorine dioxide	FT/ <del>JD</del>	N (06 17)		01 06 15 & 01 27 15	
EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern §205.603	TF	N (06 03)	TR for NPEs sent to CS 01 30 15. No action by LS needed.	02 17 15	
Flunixin §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		02 17 15	
Formic Acid §205.603	CBo	N (06 17)		02 17 15	
Furosemide §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		02 17 15	
Glucose §205.603	CW	N (07 01)		01 20 15	
Glycerine §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		02 17 15	
Lidocaine §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Magnesium hydroxide §205.603	TF	N		02 17 15	
Magnesium sulfate §205.603	TF	N		02 17 15	
Methionine §205.603	TF	N		02 17 15	
Oxytocin §205.603	CW	N (07 01)		01 20 15	
Peracetic acid §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Phosphoric acid §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Poloxalene §205.603	FT	N		02 02 15	
Procaine §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Sodium hypochlorite §205.603	FT/JD	N (06 17)		01 06 15 and 01 27 15	
Strychnine 205.604	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Sucrose octanoate esters §205.603	FT	N		02 02 15	
Trace minerals §205.603	FT	N		02 02 15	
Vaccines §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	

Tolazoline §205.603	FT	2002 TR Y	New TR requested. Not contracted.	02 02 15	
Xylazine §205.603	CBo	2002 TR Y	New TR requested. Not contracted.	02 17 15	

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst?	Notes	Vote	Meeting
AQ Review Legacy summary	TF		Summary of the AQ review to date.	02 24 15	Report Spr 2015

\* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed

### Agenda

- Approve notes from the February 24
- Approve notes from the March 3
- Approve notes from the March 17
- 2017 sunset - Electrolytes (CW) TR Sufficiency (TR sent to LS 03 27 15)
- 2017 sunset - Hydrated Lime TR Sufficiency (TR sent to LS 03 27 15)
- Assign discussion dates for 2017 sunsets
- Discuss spring meeting presentations format
- Assign lead for new petition for Acid-Activated Bentonite
- Schedule summer review discussions
- Adjourn

### Discussion

- **Notes from the February 24, March 3 and March 17** approved with minor edits submitted by several members.
- **2017 sunset - Electrolytes (CW).** CW noted that the TR was well written and found sufficient, and he summarized the petition and TR for the group. The members thought the TR answered all the questions they had posed and there was no need to pose additional questions for the next posting.
- **2017 sunset - Hydrated Lime TR sufficiency (TF).** The LS found the TR to be well written and deemed it sufficient. The lead indicated that there are some additional questions and is interested in public comment on this material.
- **Discussion dates for 2017 sunsets.** The LS Chair compiled a spreadsheet with the assignments, as some materials were reassigned. For the April meeting, the original leads will present the materials and the reassignments will apply for the fall.
- **Spring meeting presentations format.** Members discussed the 2017 summaries and how they will be presented and discussed at the spring meeting.
- **Acid-Activated Bentonite.** The LS received a new petition and assigned AS as lead reviewer.
- **Schedule summer review discussions.** The Chair summarized the next steps for the sunset review and the group will schedule discussion dates on the next call.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

**Future Call Schedule:**

**Mar 17, 2015 3:00 ET**

Discuss who will present what at the spring meeting.  
Schedule the discussions of the 2017 materials for the second posting.  
Discuss public comment

**Apr 7, 2015 3:00 ET**

2017 sunset - Electrolytes (CW) TR Sufficiency (TR sent to LS 03 27 15)  
2017 sunset - Hydrated Lime (TF) TR Sufficiency (TR sent to LS 03 27 15)  
Assign discussion dates for 2017 sunsets  
Discuss spring meeting presentations format  
Discuss public comment

**Apr 21, 2015 3:00 ET**

Discuss public comment  
Spring meeting format and presentations

**May 5, 2015 cancelled.**

**May 19, 2015**

Discuss Research priorities.  
Paraciticides (FT)

**May 26, 2015 - additional call**

Strychnine (JR)  
Glycerin (TF)

**June 2, 2015**

Vitamins (CW)

**June 16, 2015**

**Glucose, Hydrogen peroxide, isopropanol (CW)**

**June 23, 2015 - additional call**

**June 30, 2015 - additional call**

**July 7, 2015**

**July 21, 2015**

Iodine (JR) - discuss proposal & vote  
Excipients (JR) - discuss proposal & vote

**July 28, 2015 - additional call**

**August 4, 2015**

Hydrated Lime (TF)

**August 18, 2015**

Atropine, mineral oil (PD)  
Flunixin and Furosemide (AS)

**August 25, 2015 - additional call**

**September 1, 2015**

**September 15, 2015**

**October 6, 2015**

**October 20, 2015**

**November 3, 2015**

**November 17, 2015**

**December 1, 2015**

**December 15, 2015**

Spring 2015 Milestones

Target date

NOSB Training	Feb 4-5, 2015
NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2015
NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP	Feb 25, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 9, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 13, 2015
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg)	Apr 10, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 13, 2015
Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA	Week of April 27 - 30



Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting Notes  
Tuesday, April 21, 2015 3:00pm ET**

**Attending:** Tracy Favre, Chair (TF); Jean Richardson (JR); Francis Thicke (FT); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Calvin Walker, Vice Chair (CW); Ashley Swaffar (AS); Tom Chapman (TC)

**Absent:** Mac Stone (MS); Paula Daniels (PD); Carmela Beck (CBe)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

**Work Agenda**

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Vote	Meeting
<a href="#">Methionine in organic poultry feed (MET)-petitioned</a>	205.603	MS	<a href="#">2011 TR</a>	Petition recv'd 04 08 2011 TR received 11 15 11	02 17 15	Proposal Spr 2015
<a href="#">Acidified Sodium chlorite (ASC) Petition Addendum #1 Petition Addendum #2</a>	205.603 (a)(b)	JD/FT	<a href="#">2008 TR</a> <a href="#">2013 TR</a>	Petition sent to LS 06 12 12. Petition found sufficient 09 18. TR requested on 09 18 12. TR sent to LS 05 08 13. TR found suff 07 30 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled. Spring 2014 sent back to LS.	01 27 15	Proposal Spr 2015
<a href="#">Aluminum Sulfate (PDF)</a>	205.603	JR	Y	The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015.		Proposal Fall 2015
<a href="#">Sodium Bisulfate</a>	205.603	JR	Y	Petition sent to LS 05 27 14. Q's for petitioner/TR request due 07 28 14. TR request sent to NOP 08 06 14. TR expected Jan 2015.		TBD
<a href="#">Zinc Sulfate</a>	205.603	TF	<a href="#">2015</a>	Petition sent to LS 06 16 14. Q's for petitioner/TR request due 8 19 14. Limited Scope TR request sent to NOP 08 06 14. TR expected mid-Jan 2015. TR sent to LS 02 09 15. Suff due 04 10 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	02 24 15	Spr 2015

<a href="#">Acid-Activated Bentonite</a>	205.603	AS		Petition sent to LS 04 03 15. Q's for petitioner. <b>TR request due 06 02 15.</b> Two related petitions pending for treatment of poultry litter: <b>sodium bisulfate</b> and <b>aluminum sulfate</b> . <a href="#">TAP for Kaolin Clay and Bentonite 1995</a>		
<a href="#">Aquaculture-CO<sub>2</sub></a> , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Chlorine</a> (for aquatic plants)	205.609	JÐ/FT	<a href="#">2011 Crops TR</a>  <a href="#">2006 TR</a>  <a href="#">1995 TAP</a>	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Micronutrients</a> (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	<a href="#">2010 TR (Nickel)</a>  <a href="#">6/2013 Minerals TR</a>	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants)</a> (for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	<a href="#">2/2011 Crops TR</a>    <a href="#">7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR</a>	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD

<a href="#">Aquaculture- Vitamins (B1, B12, H)</a> for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	<a href="#">4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR</a>	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals</a>	205.611	JR	<a href="#">2011 TR</a> (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture - Chlorine</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	JÐ/FT	No <a href="#">Crops 2011</a> <a href="#">Crops 2006</a> <a href="#">Crops 1995</a> <a href="#">Livestock 2006</a> <a href="#">Handling 2006</a>	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture – Tocopherols</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	<a href="#">2013 TR</a> <a href="#">1995 TAP</a> <a href="#">rvw</a>	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture – Vitamins</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes <a href="#">2013 TR</a>	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with Minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture - Trace Minerals</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	<a href="#">2013 TR</a>	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

2017 Sunsets TR Requests Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015					
Substance	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Summary discussion	Meeting
Ethanol §205.603	TF	Y	Draft TR sent to LS 09 24 14. Suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 01 06 15	01 27 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015

Isopropanol §205.603	CW	Y	Draft TR sent to LS 09 24 14. Suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 01 06 15	01 06 15	
Chlorhexidine §205.603	JD/FT/ CW	2010 TR Y	TR requested 08 15 14. TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 02 26 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 03 15.	02 02 15	
Copper sulfate §205.603	TF	1995 TAP <a href="#">2015 Lmtd Scope</a>	TR in development (expected Dec 2014). TR sent to LS 02 13 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	02 24 15	
Electrolytes §205.603	CW	1995 TAP 2015 TR	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 03 27 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 07 15	02 24 15	
Excipients §205.603	CB/JR	Y	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 02 26 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 03 15.	02 24 15	
Fenbendazole §205.603	FT	1999 TR Y	Combined with other paraciticides (Moxidectin and Ivermectin). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 04 20 15. TR suff due ASAP	02 24 15	
Ivermectin §205.603	FT	1999 TR Y	Combined with other paraciticides (Fendbendazole and Moxidectin). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 04 20 15. TR suff due ASAP	02 24 15	
Moxidectin §205.603	FT	2003 TR Y	Combined with other paraciticides (Fendbendazole and Ivermectin). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 04 20 15. TR suff due ASAP	02 24 15	
Hydrated lime §205.603(b)	TF	1995 TAP	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 03 27 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 07 15	02 24 15	
Hydrogen peroxide §205.603(a)	CW	Y (for Crops 205.601(a))	TR for Crops expected Jan/Feb 2015	02 24 15	
Iodine 205.603(a)(14) and 205.603(b)(2)	JR	1994 TAP <a href="#">2015 TR</a>	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 01 07 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found sufficient 01 20 15	01 20 15 and 01 27 15	
Mineral oil §205.603	PD	2002 TR <a href="#">2015 TR</a>	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	02 17 15	
Vitamins §205.603(d)	CW	<a href="#">2015 Lmtd scope</a>	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	02 24 15	

**2017 Sunsets (No TRs) Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015**

Substance	Contact	New TR reqst?	Notes	Discussed	Meeting
-----------	---------	---------------	-------	-----------	---------

Aspirin §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015
Atropine §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		02 17 15	
Butorphanol §205.603	CBo	2002 TR Y	New TR requested. Not contracted.	02 24 15	
Calcium hypochlorite §205.603	FT/ <del>JD</del>	N (06 17)		01 06 15 and 01 27 15	
Chlorine dioxide	FT/ <del>JD</del>	N (06 17)		01 06 15 & 01 27 15	
EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern §205.603	TF	N (06 03)	TR for NPEs sent to CS 01 30 15. No action by LS needed.	02 17 15	
Flunixin §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		02 17 15	
Formic Acid §205.603	CBo	N (06 17)		02 17 15	
Furosemide §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		02 17 15	
Glucose §205.603	CW	N (07 01)		01 20 15	
Glycerine §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		02 17 15	
Lidocaine §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Magnesium hydroxide §205.603	TF	N		02 17 15	
Magnesium sulfate §205.603	TF	N		02 17 15	
Methionine §205.603	TF	N		02 17 15	
Oxytocin §205.603	CW	N (07 01)		01 20 15	
Peracetic acid §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Phosphoric acid §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Poloxalene §205.603	FT	N		02 02 15	
Procaine §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Sodium hypochlorite §205.603	FT/JD	N (06 17)		01 06 15 and 01 27 15	
Strychnine 205.604	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	

Sucrose octanoate esters §205.603	FT	N		02 02 15	
Trace minerals §205.603	FT	N		02 02 15	
Vaccines §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		01 20 15	
Tolazoline §205.603	FT	2002 TR Y	New TR requested. Not contracted.	02 02 15	
Xylazine §205.603	CBo	2002 TR Y	New TR requested. Not contracted.	02 17 15	

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst?	Notes	Vote	Meeting
AQ Review Legacy summary	TF		Summary of the AQ review to date.	02 24 15	Report Spr 2015

\* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed

### Agenda

- Approve notes from April 7
- Review Public Comments
- Discuss presentation of materials at meeting
- Adjourn

### Discussion

- **Notes from the April 7** not available for review yet.
- **Presentation of materials at spring meeting.**
  - The LS discussed materials that may need additional discussion time at the spring NOSB meeting. Some topics that received public comment include: NPEs, Iodine, Furosemide, Flunixin, Magnesium Sulfate and parasticides. The TR for parasiticides was sent to the LS April 20, and has not yet been reviewed for sufficiency.
  - The LS Chair asked that members include a summary of public comment trends, rather than counting numbers, as well as info about a materials use.
  - MET - the NOP suggested clarification for the terminology in the proposal regarding the total % of MET. Members discussed various aspects of the MET proposal as well as the comments. The group also discussed the presentation of the minority opinion. The NOSB Chair suggested a verbal discussion without a visual presentation other than the actual Board recommendation.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

### [Previous LS Notes](#)

### Future Call Schedule:

Apr 7, 2015 3:00 ET

2017 sunset - Electrolytes (CW) TR Sufficiency (TR sent to LS 03 27 15)

2017 sunset - Hydrated Lime (TF) TR Sufficiency (TR sent to LS 03 27 15)

Assign discussion dates for 2017 sunsets  
 Discuss spring meeting presentations format  
 Discuss public comment

**Apr 21, 2015 3:00 ET**

Discuss public comment  
 Spring meeting format and presentations

**May 5, 2015** cancelled.

**May 19, 2015**

Discuss Research priorities.  
 Paraciticides (FT)

**May 26, 2015 - additional call**

Strychnine (JR)  
 Glycerin (TF)

**June 2, 2015**

Vitamins (CW)

**June 16, 2015**

Glucose, Hydrogen peroxide, isopropanol (CW)

**June 23, 2015 - additional call**

**June 30, 2015 - additional call**

**July 7, 2015**

**July 21, 2015**

Iodine (JR) - discuss proposal & vote  
 Excipients (JR) - discuss proposal & vote

**July 28, 2015 - additional call**

**August 4, 2015**

Hydrated Lime (TF)

**August 18, 2015**

Atropine, mineral oil (PD)  
 Flunixin and Furosemide (AS)

**August 25, 2015 - additional call**

**September 1, 2015**

**September 15, 2015**

**October 6, 2015**

**October 20, 2015**

**November 3, 2015**

**November 17, 2015**

**December 1, 2015**

**December 15, 2015**

Spring 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOSB Training	Feb 4-5, 2015
NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2015
NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP	Feb 25, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 9, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 13, 2015

Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg)	Apr 10, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 13, 2015
Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA	Week of April 27 - 30



Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting Notes  
Tuesday, May 19, 2015 3:00pm ET**

**Attending:** Tracy Favre, Chair (TF); Jean Richardson (JR); Francis Thicke (FT); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Calvin Walker, Vice Chair (CW); Ashley Swaffar (AS), Co-VC

**Absent:** Mac Stone (MS); Paula Daniels (PD)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

**Work Agenda**

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Vote	Meeting
<a href="#">Aluminum Sulfate (PDF)</a>	205.603	JR	Y	The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TRs (2) sent to LS 05 15 15. Suff due 07 15 15		Proposal Fall 2015
<a href="#">Sodium Bisulfate</a>	205.603	JR	Y	Petition sent to LS 05 27 14. Q's for petitioner/TR request due 07 28 14. TR request sent to NOP 08 06 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TR sent to LS 05 14 15. Suff due 07 14 15. TR found suff 05 19 15		TBD
<a href="#">Acid-Activated Bentonite</a>	205.603	AS		Petition sent to LS 04 03 15. Q's for petitioner. TR request due 06 02 15. Two related petitions pending for treatment of poultry litter: <b>sodium bisulfate</b> and <b>aluminum sulfate</b> . <a href="#">TAP for Kaolin Clay and Bentonite 1995</a>		TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-CO<sub>2</sub></a> , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD

<a href="#">Aquaculture-Chlorine</a> (for aquatic plants)	205.609	JD/FT	<a href="#">2011 Crops TR</a> <a href="#">2006 TR</a> <a href="#">1995 TAP</a>	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Micronutrients</a> (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	<a href="#">2010 TR (Nickel)</a> <a href="#">6/2013 Minerals TR</a>	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants)</a> (for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	<a href="#">2/2011 Crops TR</a> <a href="#">7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR</a>	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Vitamins (B1, B12, H)</a> for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	<a href="#">4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR</a>	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals</a>	205.611	JR	<a href="#">2011 TR</a> (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD

<a href="#">Aquaculture - Chlorine</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	JD/FT	No <a href="#">Crops 2011</a> <a href="#">Crops 2006</a> <a href="#">Crops 1995</a> <a href="#">Livestock 2006</a> <a href="#">Handling 2006</a>	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture – Tocopherols</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	<a href="#">2013 TR</a> <a href="#">1995 TAP</a> <a href="#">rvw</a>	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture – Vitamins</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes <a href="#">2013 TR</a>	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with Minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture - Trace Minerals</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	<a href="#">2013 TR</a>	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

2017 Sunsets TR Requests Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015					
Substance	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Discussion scheduled:	Meeting
Ethanol §205.603	TF	Y	Draft TR sent to LS 09 24 14. Suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 01 06 15	08 18 15	Review: Fall 2015
Isopropanol §205.603	CW	Y	Draft TR sent to LS 09 24 14. Suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 01 06 15	06 18 16	
Chlorhexidine §205.603	JD/FT/ CW	2010 TR Y	TR requested 08 15 14. TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 02 26 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 03 15.	06 02 15	
Copper sulfate §205.603	TF	1995 TAP <a href="#">2015 Lmtd Scope</a>	TR in development (expected Dec 2014). TR sent to LS 02 13 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	05 26 15	

Electrolytes §205.603	CW	1995 TAP 2015 TR	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 03 27 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 07 15	08 04 15	
Excipients §205.603	CBo/JR	Y	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 02 26 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 03 15.	07 21 15	
Paraciticides - Fenbendazole §205.603	FT	1999 TR Y	Combined with other paraciticides (Moxidectin and Ivermectin). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 04 20 15. TR suff due ASAP. TR found suff 05 19 15	05 26 15	
Paraciticides - Ivermectin §205.603	FT	1999 TR Y	Combined with other paraciticides (Fendbendazole and Moxidectin). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 04 20 15. TR suff due ASAP. TR found suff 05 19 15	05 26 15	
Paraciticides - Moxidectin §205.603	FT	2003 TR Y	Combined with other paraciticides (Fendbendazole and Ivermectin). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 04 20 15. TR suff due ASAP. TR found suff 05 19 15	05 26 15	
Hydrated lime §205.603(b)	TF	1995 TAP	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 03 27 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 07 15	08 04 15	
Hydrogen peroxide §205.603(a)	CW	Y (for Crops 205.601(a))	TR for Crops expected Jan/Feb 2015	06 16 15	
Iodine 205.603(a)(14) and 205.603(b)(2)	JR	1994 TAP <a href="#">2015 TR</a>	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 01 07 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found sufficient 01 20 15	07 21 15	
Mineral oil §205.603	PD	2002 TR <a href="#">2015 TR</a>	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	08 18 15	
Vitamins §205.603(d)	CW	<a href="#">2015 Lmtd scope</a>	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	06 02 15	

**2017 Sunsets (No TRs) Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015**

Substance	Contact	New TR reqst?	Notes	Discussion scheduled	Meeting
Aspirin §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		05 19 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015
Atropine §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		08 18 15	
Butorphanol §205.603	CBo	2002 TR Y	New TR requested. Not contracted.	06 23 15	
Calcium hypochlorite §205.603	FT/ <del>JD</del>	N (06 17)		07 21 15	

Chlorine dioxide	FT/ <del>JD</del>	N (06 17)		07 21 15	
EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern §205.603	TF	N (06 03)	TR for NPEs sent to CS 01 30 15. No action by LS needed.	05 26 15	
Flunixin §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		08 18 15	
Formic Acid §205.603	CBo	N (06 17)		07 07 15	
Furosemide §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		08 18 15	
Glucose §205.603	CW	N (07 01)		06 16 15	
Glycerine §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		05 26 15	
Lidocaine §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		05 19 15	
Magnesium hydroxide §205.603	TF	N		08 25 15	
Magnesium sulfate §205.603	TF	N		08 25 15	
Methionine §205.603	TF	N		06 02 15	
Oxytocin §205.603	CW	N (07 01)		08 04 15	
Peracetic acid §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		08 18 15	
Phosphoric acid §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		05 26 15	
Poloxalene §205.603	FT	N		06 02 15	
Procaine §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		05 19 15	
Sodium hypochlorite §205.603	FT/JD	N (06 17)		07 21 15	
Strychnine 205.604	JR	N (04 01)		05 26 15	
Sucrose octanoate esters §205.603	FT	N		06 02 15	
Trace minerals §205.603	FT	N		08 04 15	
Vaccines §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		05 26 15	
Tolazoline §205.603	FT	2002 TR Y	New TR requested. Not contracted.	08 04 15	
Xylazine §205.603	CBo	2002 TR Y	New TR requested. Not contracted.	08 04 15	

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst?	Notes	Vote	Meeting

\* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed

### Agenda

- Approve notes from April 7 and April 21
- Discuss Research priorities
- 2017 sunsets - Paraciticides (FT)
- 2017 sunsets - Aspirin, Lidocaine, Procaine (JR)
- Discuss Public comment on AQ legacy doc
- Adjourn

### Discussion

- **Notes from the April 7 and April 21** approved with no changes
- **Research priorities** - The LS Chair reminded the members to keep the research priorities in mind as they are reviewing materials, so they can send them to the Materials Subcomm in a timely manner.
- **2017 sunsets - Paraciticides (FT)**. The lead summarized his work to date and the group discussed the three materials including the risks of resistance, possible alternatives, and the impact on the industry were they to remove one or two of the materials from the National List. The lead noted that Fenbendazole is the most benign, and suggested if they were to remove any, Ivermectin might be a candidate. A member noted that Ivermectin is the most widely used. Members discussed the need for more research and may include this as a research priority. The TRs were found sufficient and the LS will vote on the materials on the next call. TF will let LB know. The NOP added some additional info garnered from the FDA about paraciticides and use in swine and sheep. Upon initial review, it seems like it contradicts info presented in the TR. JR and FT will look further at this and report back to the group on the next call. The TR may need correction; NOP will check with the contractor.
- **2017 sunsets - Aspirin, Lidocaine, Procaine (JR)**. The lead summarized the three materials noted that each material was evaluated against the OFPA criteria and was found to satisfy all of them. The LS will include a statement to that effect. The group proceeded to a vote.

Motion to remove **Aspirin** from §205.603

Motion by: JR

Seconded by: TF

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

Motion to remove **Lidocaine** from §205.603

Motion by: JR

Seconded by: CW

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

Motion to remove **Procaine** from §205.603

Motion by: JR

Seconded by: CW

Additional Discussion: The LS Chair asked if there was a need for both lidocaine and procaine. The lead answered that although lidocaine is more widely used veterinarians prefer to use procaine

Yes: 1 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

The lead indicated that she will develop alternative proposals for lidocaine and procaine with a modified/reduced withdrawal period. These proposals will be independent of the sunset review.

- **2017 sunsets - EPA List 4 Inerts.** Members discussed public comments, some of which requested that inert materials be reviewed individually. The NOSB will be working with the EPAs Safer Choice Program and the Inerts working groups, independent of the sunset review, and may have a document or update for the fall NOSB meeting. The lead will write the sunset review and provide it to the group so they can vote on next call.
- **Sodium bisulfate (petitioned) (JR).** Used as litter treatment in poultry houses. Similar to aluminum sulfate, which the Crops Subcommittee is reviewing. JR will confer with ZS for Crops. The TR was found sufficient.
- **Discuss Public comment on AQ legacy document.** A member asked that the public comment from the April meeting (both oral and written) be incorporated into the document and placed somewhere so that future iterations of the NOSB have that record.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

## [Previous LS Notes](#)

### **Future Call Schedule:**

May 5, 2015 cancelled

#### **May 19, 2015**

Discuss Research priorities

2017 sunsets - Paracitocides (FT)

2017 sunsets - Aspirin, Lidocaine, Procaine (JR)

#### **May 26, 2015 - additional call**

Strychnine (JR)

Glycerin (TF)

2017 sunsets - Paracitocides (FT) review proposals and vote

EPA List 4 Inerts discuss review and vote

Aluminum sulfate discuss review

#### **June 2, 2015**

Vitamins (CW)

#### **June 16, 2015**

Glucose, Hydrogen peroxide, isopropanol (CW)

#### **June 23, 2015 - additional call**

**June 30, 2015 - additional call**

**July 7, 2015**

**July 21, 2015**

Iodine (JR) - discuss proposal & vote

Excipients (JR) - discuss proposal & vote

**July 28, 2015 - additional call**

**August 4, 2015**

Hydrated Lime (TF)

**August 18, 2015**

Atropine, mineral oil (PD)

Flunixin and Furosemide (AS)

**August 25, 2015 - additional call**

**September 1, 2015**

**September 15, 2015**

**October 6, 2015**

**October 20, 2015**

**November 3, 2015**

**November 17, 2015**

**December 1, 2015**

**December 15, 2015**

<b>Spring 2015 Milestones</b>	<b>Target date</b>
NOSB Training	Feb 4-5, 2015
NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2015
NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP	Feb 25, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 9, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 13, 2015
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg)	Apr 10, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 13, 2015
Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA	Week of April 27 - 30



Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting Notes  
Tuesday, May 26, 2015 3:00pm ET**

**Attending:** Tracy Favre, Chair (TF); Jean Richardson (JR); Ashley Swaffar (AS), Co-VC; Francis Thicke (FT); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Calvin Walker, Vice Chair (CW)

**Absent:** Emily Brown Rosen (EBR); Mac Stone (MS); Paula Daniels (PD)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

**Work Agenda**

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Vote	Meeting
<a href="#">Aluminum Sulfate (PDF)</a>	205.603	JR	Y	The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TRs (2) sent to LS 05 15 15. Suff due 07 15 15		Proposal Fall 2015
<a href="#">Sodium Bisulfate</a>	205.603	JR	<a href="#">2015</a>	Petition sent to LS 05 27 14. Q's for petitioner/TR request due 07 28 14. TR request sent to NOP 08 06 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TR sent to LS 05 14 15. Suff due 07 14 15. TR found suff 05 19 15		TBD
<a href="#">Acid-Activated Bentonite</a>	205.603	AS		Petition sent to LS 04 03 15. Q's for petitioner. TR request due 06 02 15. Two related petitions pending for treatment of poultry litter: <b>sodium bisulfate</b> and <b>aluminum sulfate</b> . <a href="#">TAP for Kaolin Clay and Bentonite 1995</a>		TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-CO<sub>2</sub></a> , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD

<a href="#">Aquaculture-Chlorine</a> (for aquatic plants)	205.609	JD/FT	<a href="#">2011 Crops TR</a> <a href="#">2006 TR</a> <a href="#">1995 TAP</a>	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Micronutrients</a> (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	<a href="#">2010 TR (Nickel)</a> <a href="#">6/2013 Minerals TR</a>	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants)</a> (for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	<a href="#">2/2011 Crops TR</a> <a href="#">7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR</a>	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Vitamins (B1, B12, H)</a> for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	<a href="#">4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR</a>	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals</a>	205.611	JR	<a href="#">2011 TR</a> (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD

<a href="#">Aquaculture - Chlorine</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	No <a href="#">Crops 2011</a> <a href="#">Crops 2006</a> <a href="#">Crops 1995</a> <a href="#">Livestock 2006</a> <a href="#">Handling 2006</a>	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture – Tocopherols</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	<a href="#">2013 TR</a> <a href="#">1995 TAP</a> <a href="#">rvw</a>	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture – Vitamins</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes <a href="#">2013 TR</a>	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with Minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture - Trace Minerals</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	<a href="#">2013 TR</a>	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

2017 Sunsets TR Requests Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015					
Substance	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Discussion scheduled:	Meeting
Ethanol §205.603	TF	Y	Draft TR sent to LS 09 24 14. Suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 01 06 15	08 18 15	Review: Fall 2015
Isopropanol §205.603	CW	Y	Draft TR sent to LS 09 24 14. Suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 01 06 15	06 18 16	
Chlorhexidine §205.603	FT/CW	2010 TR Y	TR requested 08 15 14. TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 02 26 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 03 15.	06 02 15	
Copper sulfate §205.603	TF	1995 TAP <a href="#">2015 Lmtd Scope</a>	TR in development (expected Dec 2014). TR sent to LS 02 13 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	05 26 15	

Electrolytes §205.603	CW	1995 TAP 2015 TR	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 03 27 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 07 15	08 04 15	
Excipients §205.603	JR	Y	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 02 26 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 03 15.	07 21 15	
Fenbendazole §205.603	FT	1999 TR Y	Combined with other paraciticides (Moxidectin and Ivermectin). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 04 20 15. TR suff due ASAP	05 19 15 Vote 06 02 15	
Ivermectin §205.603	FT	1999 TR Y	Combined with other paraciticides (Fendbendazole and Moxidectin). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 04 20 15. TR suff due ASAP	05 19 15 Vote 06 02 15	
Moxidectin §205.603	FT	2003 TR Y	Combined with other paraciticides (Fendbendazole and Ivermectin). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 04 20 15. TR suff due ASAP	05 19 15 Vote 06 02 15	
Hydrated lime §205.603(b)	TF	1995 TAP	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 03 27 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 07 15	08 04 15	
Hydrogen peroxide §205.603(a)	CW	Y (for Crops 205.601(a))	TR for Crops expected Jan/Feb 2015	06 16 15	
Iodine 205.603(a)(14) and 205.603(b)(2)	JR	1994 TAP <a href="#">2015 TR</a>	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 01 07 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found sufficient 01 20 15	07 21 15	
Mineral oil §205.603	PD	2002 TR <a href="#">2015 TR</a>	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	08 18 15	
Vitamins §205.603(d)	CW	<a href="#">2015 Lmtd scope</a>	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	06 02 15	

### 2017 Sunsets (No TRs) Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015

Substance	Contact	New TR reqst?	Notes	Discussion scheduled	Meeting
Aspirin §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		05 19 15	Review: Fall 2015
Atropine §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		08 18 15	
Butorphanol §205.603	CBo	2002 TR Y	New TR requested. Not contracted.	06 23 15	
Chlorine Mtrls: Calcium hypochlorite §205.603	FT	N (06 17)		07 21 15	
Chlorine Mtrls: Chlorine dioxide	FT	N (06 17)		07 21 15	

Chlorine Mtrls: Sodium hypochlorite §205.603	AS	N (06 17)		07 21 15	
EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern §205.603	TF	N (06 03)	TR for NPEs sent to CS 01 30 15. No action by LS needed.	05 26 15	
Flunixin §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		08 18 15	
Formic Acid §205.603	CBo	N (06 17)		07 07 15	
Furosemide §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		08 18 15	
Glucose §205.603	CW	N (07 01)		06 16 15	
Glycerine §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		05 26 15	
Lidocaine §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		05 19 15	
Magnesium hydroxide §205.603	TF	N		08 25 15	
Magnesium sulfate §205.603	TF	N		08 25 15	
Methionine §205.603	TF	N		06 02 15	
Oxytocin §205.603	CW	N (07 01)		08 04 15	
Peracetic acid §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		08 18 15	
Phosphoric acid §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		05 26 15	
Poloxalene §205.603	FT	N		06 02 15	
Procaine §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		05 19 15	
Strychnine 205.604	JR	N (04 01)		05 26 15	
Sucrose octanoate esters §205.603	FT	N		06 02 15	
Trace minerals §205.603	FT	N		08 04 15	
Vaccines §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		05 26 15	
Tolazoline §205.603	FT	2002 TR Y	New TR requested. Not contracted.	08 04 15	
Xylazine §205.603	CBo	2002 TR Y	New TR requested. Not contracted.	08 04 15	

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst?	Notes	Vote	Meeting

\* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed \*Highlight indicates review completion

### Agenda

- Approve notes from May 19, 2015
- 2017 sunsets - Vaccines, Phosphoric acid, Strychnine (JR)
- 2017 sunsets - Copper sulfate, Glycerin (TF)
- 2017 sunsets - Paracitocides (FT) Continue discussion and vote
- 2017 sunsets - EPA List 4 Inerts of Minimal Concern
- Adjourn

### Discussion

- **Notes from the** May 19, 2015 not available for review
- **2017 sunsets (JR)**
  - **Vaccines.** The sunset review document was synthesized from the recent review documents. The members briefly discussed the material, noting that vaccines are critical for the prevention of disease and suffering in livestock, and satisfy the OFPA criteria. Since antibiotics are not allowed in organic livestock, both the NOSB and the public strongly support the continued use of vaccines. The LS proceeded to a vote.

Motion to remove Vaccines from §205.603

Motion by: JR

Seconded by: CW

Additional Discussion: A member asked for clarification about the prevalence of genetically modified vaccines. The lead noted that, with a few exceptions, vaccines are not genetically modified and that the current allowance is for non-GMO vaccines.

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

Motion failed

- **Phosphoric acid.** The lead summarized the review noting that this material satisfies the OFPA criteria. The LS proceeded to a vote.

Motion to remove Phosphoric acid from §205.603

Motion by: JR

Seconded by: FT

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

Motion failed

- **Strychnine (JR).** Strychnine is presently prohibited, and public sentiment supports the continuation of that status.

Motion to remove Strychnine from §205.604

Motion by: JR  
Seconded by: CW  
Additional Discussion: none  
Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0  
Motion failed

- **2017 sunsets (TF)**

- **Copper sulfate.** Topical treatment used in walk-through footbaths. Once copper binds to soil it is difficult to remove, so there are some concerns in agricultural production. There are management and disposal practices in place to regulate this, and as such the Livestock Subcommittee believes this is an important tool for livestock producers and recommends that it remain on the list.

Motion to remove Copper Sulfate from §205.603(b)

Motion by: TF

Seconded by: JR

Additional Discussion: A member asked about the possible need for an annotation, but the lead indicated that there are already requirements for management practices and no need for an additional annotation. Another member asked about the use of Zinc Sulfate if it was available. Public comment indicated that if Zinc Sulfate were allowed, the use of Copper Sulfate would be reduced.

Yes: 1 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

Motion failed

- **Glycerin.** Glycerin has a wide variety of uses: as a food additive, a carrier for flavors and colors, and as a humectant. Glycerin also has antibacterial, anti-fungal and anti-viral properties. It is not expected to bioaccumulate, and readily degrades. The public comment indicates support of continued listing.

Motion to remove Glycerin from §205.605(a)

Motion by: TF

Seconded by: AS

Additional Discussion: In response to a members question about comments opposing the relisting, the lead indicated that there was only overwhelming support. The NOP asked if glycerin was typically used as an excipient or as an active ingredient, and the lead noted that it was both.

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 1 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

Motion failed

- **2017 sunsets - Parasticides (FT). Continue discussion and vote.**

- The group continued the discussion from the last call about the three parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, and Moxidectin. Most commenters indicated they would like to see Ivermectin removed, because it harms dung beetles, which are vital for decomposing manure patties in pasture. The lead recommended relisting Moxidectin and Fenbendazole, adding that since Moxidectin and Ivermectin are in same class, removing one would not cause a gap. Others felt that all three should remain on the list. Members discussed the contents of the draft proposal and made some suggestions for edits, which the lead will incorporate. A member asked that the lead include or make more prominent, information about how each of these materials is administered and

used, and how each material was weighed against the OFPA criteria. The group chose to delay the vote. The lead will edit the draft doc and send it to the members by the end of the week so they can vote on the next call.

- **2017 sunsets (TF) - EPA List 4 Inerts of Minimal Concern**
  - Used for a wide range of applications including surfactants and adjuvants in pesticide, herbicide and fungicide formulations. The EPA no longer maintains or uses List 4 so this is a difficult class and topic for the NOSB to review. The lead noted that some of the materials on the list have serious health impacts. The Crops Subcommittee requested a TR on NPEs and is currently working with the EPAs Safer Choice program. The proposal contains language regarding the collaboration between the NOSB and EPAs Safer Choice program so it is clear that each of the materials is subjected to the EPAs review criteria. The LS proceeded to a vote on these materials.

Motion to remove EPA List 4 Inerts of Minimal Concern from §205.603(e)

Motion by: TF

Seconded by: JR

Additional Discussion: A member asked about continued work on the annotation to exclude NPEs. The NOSB Chair and Livestock Chair both support the annotation, but this work is on hold until the work by the NOP and EPA is farther along, which will be much more useful to the NOSB work. The member who brought up the topic was invited to develop a proposal to annotate the NPEs and will inform the group on the next call if this is the direction he will go. The NOP supports this approach but it must be a project separate from the sunset review.

Yes: 1 No: 4 Abstain: 1 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

Motion failed

- **The meeting was adjourned**

## [Previous LS Notes](#)

### **Future Call Schedule:**

#### **May 19, 2015**

Discuss Research priorities

2017 sunsets - Paracitocides (FT)

2017 sunsets - Aspirin, Lidocaine, Procaine (JR)

#### **May 26, 2015 - additional call**

2017 sunsets - Strychnine (JR)

2017 sunsets - Glycerin (TF)

2017 sunsets - Paracitocides (FT) review proposals and vote

2017 sunsets - EPA List 4 Inerts discuss review and vote

Aluminum sulfate (petitioned) - discuss review

#### **June 2, 2015**

Acid-Activated Bentonite - TR sufficiency

2017 sunsets - (FT) Review and vote on 4 proposals

2017 sunsets - (CW) Vitamins

2017 sunsets - (TF) MET



Discuss proposals for annotation changes.

**June 16, 2015**

Glucose, Hydrogen peroxide, isopropanol (CW)

**June 23, 2015 - additional call**

**June 30, 2015 - additional call**

**July 7, 2015**

**July 21, 2015**

Iodine (JR) - discuss proposal & vote

Excipients (JR) - discuss proposal & vote

**July 28, 2015 - additional call**

**August 4, 2015**

Hydrated Lime (TF)

**August 18, 2015**

Atropine, mineral oil (PD)

Flunixin and Furosemide (AS)

**August 25, 2015 - additional call**

**September 1, 2015**

**September 15, 2015**

**October 6, 2015**

**October 20, 2015**

**November 3, 2015**

**November 17, 2015**

**December 1, 2015**

**December 15, 2015**

Fall 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOP - Complete Fall 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	July 8, 2015
NOSB - Fall 2015 proposals due to NOP	Aug 26, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 8, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Sep 11, 2015
Public comment closes	Oct 5, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Oct 8, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 13, 2015
Fall 2015 NOSB meeting - Stowe, VT	Oct 26 - 29, 2015

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting Notes  
Tuesday, June 2, 2015 3:00pm ET**

**Attending:** Tracy Favre, Chair (TF); Jean Richardson (JR); Ashley Swaffar (AS), Co-VC; Francis Thicke (FT); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Calvin Walker, Vice Chair (CW)

**Absent:** Mac Stone (MS); Paula Daniels (PD)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

**Work Agenda**

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Vote	Meeting
<a href="#">Aluminum Sulfate (PDF)</a>	205.603	JR	Y	The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TRs (2) sent to LS 05 15 15. Suff due 07 15 15		Proposal Fall 2015
<a href="#">Sodium Bisulfate</a>	205.603	JR	<a href="#">2015</a>	Petition sent to LS 05 27 14. Q's for petitioner/TR request due 07 28 14. TR request sent to NOP 08 06 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TR sent to LS 05 14 15. Suff due 07 14 15. TR found suff 05 19 15		TBD
<a href="#">Acid-Activated Bentonite</a>	205.603	AS		Petition sent to LS 04 03 15. Q's for petitioner. TR request due 06 02 15. Petition found suff 06 02 15. Determine need for TR  Two related petitions pending for treatment of poultry litter: <b>sodium bisulfate</b> and <b>aluminum sulfate</b> . <a href="#">TAP for Kaolin Clay and Bentonite 1995</a>		TBD

<a href="#">Aquaculture-CO<sub>2</sub></a> , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqtst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Chlorine</a> (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	<a href="#">2011 Crops TR</a> <a href="#">2006 TR</a> <a href="#">1995 TAP</a>	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Micronutrients</a> (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	<a href="#">2010 TR (Nickel)</a> <a href="#">6/2013 Minerals TR</a>	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants)</a> (for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	<a href="#">2/2011 Crops TR</a> <a href="#">7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR</a>	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Vitamins (B1, B12, H)</a> for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	<a href="#">4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR</a>	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals</a>	205.611	JR	<a href="#">2011 TR</a> (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD

<a href="#">Aquaculture - Chlorine</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	No <a href="#">Crops 2011</a> <a href="#">Crops 2006</a> <a href="#">Crops 1995</a> <a href="#">Livestock 2006</a> <a href="#">Handling 2006</a>	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture – Tocopherols</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	<a href="#">2013 TR</a> <a href="#">1995 TAP</a> <a href="#">rvw</a>	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture – Vitamins</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes <a href="#">2013 TR</a>	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with Minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture - Trace Minerals</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	<a href="#">2013 TR</a>	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

2017 Sunsets TR Requests Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015					
Substance	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Discussion scheduled:	Meeting
Ethanol §205.603	TF	Y	Draft TR sent to LS 09 24 14. Suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 01 06 15	08 18 15	Review: Fall 2015
Isopropanol §205.603	CW	Y	Draft TR sent to LS 09 24 14. Suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 01 06 15	06 18 16	
Chlorhexidine §205.603	FT/CW	2010 TR Y	TR requested 08 15 14. TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 02 26 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 03 15.	06 16 15	
Copper sulfate §205.603	TF	1995 TAP <a href="#">2015 Lmtd Scope</a>	TR in development (expected Dec 2014). TR sent to LS 02 13 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	05 26 15	

Electrolytes §205.603	CW	1995 TAP 2015 TR	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 03 27 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 07 15	08 04 15	
Excipients §205.603	JR	Y	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 02 26 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 03 15.	07 21 15	
Fenbendazole §205.603	FT	1999 TR Y	Combined with other paraciticides (Moxidectin and Ivermectin). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 04 20 15. TR suff due ASAP	05 19 15 Vote 06 02 15	
Ivermectin §205.603	FT	1999 TR Y	Combined with other paraciticides (Fendbendazole and Moxidectin). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 04 20 15. TR suff due ASAP	05 19 15 Vote 06 02 15	
Moxidectin §205.603	FT	2003 TR Y	Combined with other paraciticides (Fendbendazole and Ivermectin). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 04 20 15. TR suff due ASAP	05 19 15 Vote 06 02 15	
Hydrated lime §205.603(b)	TF	1995 TAP	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 03 27 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 07 15	08 04 15	
Hydrogen peroxide §205.603(a)	CW	Y (for Crops 205.601(a))	TR for Crops expected Jan/Feb 2015	06 16 15	
Iodine 205.603(a)(14) and 205.603(b)(2)	JR	1994 TAP <a href="#">2015 TR</a>	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 01 07 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found sufficient 01 20 15	07 21 15	
Mineral oil §205.603	PD	2002 TR <a href="#">2015 TR</a>	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	08 18 15	
Vitamins §205.603(d)	CW	<a href="#">2015 Lmtd scope</a>	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	06 02 15	

### 2017 Sunsets (No TRs) Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015

Substance	Contact	New TR reqst?	Notes	Discussion scheduled	Meeting
Aspirin §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		05 19 15	Review: Fall 2015
Atropine §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		08 18 15	
Butorphanol §205.603	CBo	2002 TR Y	New TR requested. Not contracted.	06 23 15	
Chlorine Mtrls: Calcium hypochlorite §205.603	FT	N (06 17)		07 21 15	
Chlorine Mtrls: Chlorine dioxide	FT	N (06 17)		07 21 15	

Chlorine Mtrls: Sodium hypochlorite §205.603	AS	N (06 17)		07 21 15	
EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern §205.603	TF	N (06 03)	TR for NPEs sent to CS 01 30 15. No action by LS needed.	05 26 15	
Flunixin §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		08 18 15	
Formic Acid §205.603	CBo	N (06 17)		07 07 15	
Furosemide §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		08 18 15	
Glucose §205.603	CW	N (07 01)		06 16 15	
Glycerine §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		05 26 15	
Lidocaine §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		05 19 15	
Magnesium hydroxide §205.603	TF	N		08 25 15	
Magnesium sulfate §205.603	TF	N		08 25 15	
Methionine §205.603	TF	N		06 02 15	
Oxytocin §205.603	CW	N (07 01)		08 04 15	
Peracetic acid §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		08 18 15	
Phosphoric acid §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		05 26 15	
Poloxalene §205.603	FT	N		06 16 15	
Procaine §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		05 19 15	
Strychnine 205.604	JR	N (04 01)		05 26 15	
Sucrose octanoate esters §205.603	FT	N		06 16 15	
Trace minerals §205.603	FT	N		08 04 15	
Vaccines §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		05 26 15	
Tolazoline §205.603	FT	2002 TR Y	New TR requested. Not contracted.	08 04 15	
Xylazine §205.603	CBo	2002 TR Y	New TR requested. Not contracted.	08 04 15	

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst?	Notes	Vote	Meeting

\* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed \*Highlight indicates review completion

### Agenda

- Approve notes from May 19, 2015
- Approve notes from May 26, 2015
- Acid-Activated Bentonite (AS) - Petition sufficiency due June 2
- 2017 sunsets - (FT) Review and vote on 4 proposals (finish parasiticides + 3 others)
- 2017 sunsets - (CW) Vitamins
- 2017 sunsets - (TF) MET
- Discuss proposals for annotation changes.
- Adjourn

### Discussion

- **Notes from the May 19, 2015** approved as is
- **Notes from the May 26, 2015** approved as is
- **Acid-Activated Bentonite** - The LS determined the petition to be sufficient via email in April. The Chair will relay that information to the National List Manager.
- **2017 sunsets - (FT). Review and vote**
  - **Parasiticides.** The NOSB Chair relayed information gleaned via verbal communication she had with a veterinarian regarding Ivermectin. The lead reviewer summarized public comment, which was mixed. Each of the parasiticides has different uses so the group discussed and will vote on them individually. Ivermectin was found to fail the OFPA criteria regarding environmental impacts, because it is harmful to dung beetles and soil, while Fendbendazole was found to satisfy all OFPA criteria. Moxidectin is less harmful to dung beetles than Ivermectin, and is labeled for sheep. It is also available in topical formulations. Some members favor removal of Moxidectin while others support the need for two types of parasiticides that can be used in rotation to prevent resistance. A member reminded the group that the Livestock Subcommittee plans to develop a proposal to alter the withholding period for Fendbendazole. Members discussed the use of paraciticides in sheep and the NOP noted that they returned the TR to the contractor with a request for edits about usage.

Motion to remove **Ivermectin** from §205.603

Motion by: FT

Seconded by: JR

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 5 No: 1 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

Motion to remove **Moxidectin** from §205.603

Motion by: FT

Seconded by: JR

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 4 No: 2 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

Motion to remove **Fendbendazole** from §205.603

Motion by: FT

Seconded by: JR

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **2017 sunsets - (FT). Chlorhexidine, Poloxalene, Sucrose octanoate esters** - Deferred to next call.
- **2017 sunsets - (CW). Vitamins.** Vitamins are essential for animal health, but not all can be supplied in feed. Commenters were in favor of keeping vitamins on the list.

Motion to remove Vitamins from §205.603(d)

Motion by: CW

Seconded by: JR

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **2017 sunsets - (TF). MET.** The lead summarized the sunset review. Members discussed what to include and how to present the sunset review in light of the recent petition for the same substance. The majority of members felt the two should be kept distinct, and the sunset review document should be shortened. The lead will edit/shorten the draft document, include links to historical information from the petition review, and recirculate it to members.

Motion to remove Methionine from §205.603

Motion by: TF

Seconded by: CBo

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 1 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **Proposals for annotation changes.** The LS discussed several materials for which they will propose annotation changes, which may be done at the same meeting as the sunset review, but as separate proposals. Materials include Lidocaine, Procaine, and Iodine and the 3 parasiticides. For example, the LS will propose to shorten the withholding period for Lidocaine. New science and research indicates that the withholding period is far too long and can be shortened, and public comment indicated strong support for this change. An annotation change regarding NPEs in Iodine was also discussed. The LS would like to add this to the work agenda and will send a request to the NOP in support of this.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

## [Previous LS Notes](#)

### **Future Call Schedule:**

May 26, 2015 - additional call

2017 sunsets - Strychnine (JR)

2017 sunsets - Glycerin (TF)

2017 sunsets - Paraciticides (FT) review proposals and vote

2017 sunsets - EPA List 4 Inerts discuss review and **vote**



Aluminum sulfate (petitioned) - discuss review

**June 2, 2015**

Acid-Activated Bentonite - TR sufficiency

2017 sunsets - (FT) Review and vote on 4 proposals (finish parasiticides, + 3)

2017 sunsets - (CW) Vitamins

2017 sunsets - (TF) MET

Discuss proposals for annotation changes

**June 16, 2015**

2017 sunsets - (FT) Review and vote on 3 reviews (Chlorhexidine, Poloxalene, Sucrose octanoate esters)

Glucose, Hydrogen peroxide, Isopropanol (CW)

**June 23, 2015 - additional call**

**June 30, 2015 - additional call**

**July 7, 2015**

**July 21, 2015**

Iodine (JR) - discuss proposal & vote

Excipients (JR) - discuss proposal & vote

**July 28, 2015 - additional call**

**August 4, 2015**

Hydrated Lime (TF)

**August 18, 2015**

Atropine, mineral oil (PD)

Flunixin and Furosemide (AS)

**August 25, 2015 - additional call**

**September 1, 2015**

**September 15, 2015**

**October 6, 2015**

**October 20, 2015**

**November 3, 2015**

**November 17, 2015**

**December 1, 2015**

**December 15, 2015**

Fall 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOP - Complete Fall 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	July 8, 2015
Request for TRs for 2018 sunset materials	July 15, 2015
NOSB - Fall 2015 proposals due to NOP	Aug 26, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 8, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Sep 11, 2015
Public comment closes	Oct 5, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Oct 8, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 13, 2015
Fall 2015 NOSB meeting - Stowe, VT	Oct 26 - 29, 2015

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting Notes  
Tuesday, June 16, 2015 3:00pm ET**

**Attending:** Tracy Favre, Chair (TF); Jean Richardson (JR); Ashley Swaffar (AS), Co-VC; Francis Thicke (FT); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Calvin Walker, Vice Chair (CW)

**Absent:** Mac Stone (MS); Paula Daniels (PD)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

**Work Agenda**

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Vote	Meeting
<a href="#">Aluminum Sulfate (PDF)</a>	205.603	JR	Y	The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TRs (2) sent to LS 05 15 15. Suff due 07 15 15		Proposal Fall 2015
<a href="#">Sodium Bisulfate</a>	205.603	JR	<a href="#">2015</a>	Petition sent to LS 05 27 14. Q's for petitioner/TR request due 07 28 14. TR request sent to NOP 08 06 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TR sent to LS 05 14 15. Suff due 07 14 15. TR found suff 05 19 15		TBD
<a href="#">Acid-Activated Bentonite</a>	205.603	AS		Petition sent to LS 04 03 15. Q's for petitioner. TR request due 06 02 15. Petition found suff 06 02 15. Determine need for TR  Two related petitions pending for treatment of poultry litter: <b>sodium bisulfate</b> and <b>aluminum sulfate</b> . <a href="#">TAP for Kaolin Clay and Bentonite 1995</a>		TBD

<a href="#">Aquaculture-CO<sub>2</sub></a> , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqtst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Chlorine</a> (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	<a href="#">2011 Crops TR</a> <a href="#">2006 TR</a> <a href="#">1995 TAP</a>	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Micronutrients</a> (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	<a href="#">2010 TR (Nickel)</a> <a href="#">6/2013 Minerals TR</a>	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants)</a> (for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	<a href="#">2/2011 Crops TR</a> <a href="#">7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR</a>	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Vitamins (B1, B12, H)</a> for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	<a href="#">4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR</a>	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals</a>	205.611	JR	<a href="#">2011 TR</a> (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD

<a href="#">Aquaculture - Chlorine</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	No <a href="#">Crops 2011</a> <a href="#">Crops 2006</a> <a href="#">Crops 1995</a> <a href="#">Livestock 2006</a> <a href="#">Handling 2006</a>	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture – Tocopherols</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	<a href="#">2013 TR</a> <a href="#">1995 TAP</a> <a href="#">rvw</a>	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture – Vitamins</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes <a href="#">2013 TR</a>	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with Minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture - Trace Minerals</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	<a href="#">2013 TR</a>	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

2017 Sunsets TR Requests Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015					
Substance	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Discussion scheduled:	Meeting
Ethanol §205.603	TF	Y	Draft TR sent to LS 09 24 14. Suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 01 06 15	08 18 15	Review: Fall 2015
Isopropanol §205.603	CW	Y	Draft TR sent to LS 09 24 14. Suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 01 06 15	06 16 16	
Chlorhexidine §205.603	FT/CW	2010 TR Y	TR requested 08 15 14. TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 02 26 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 03 15.	06 16 15	
Copper sulfate §205.603	TF	1995 TAP <a href="#">2015 Lmtd Scope</a>	TR in development (expected Dec 2014). TR sent to LS 02 13 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	05 26 15	

Electrolytes §205.603	CW	1995 TAP 2015 TR	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 03 27 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 07 15	08 04 15	
Excipients §205.603	JR	Y	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 02 26 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 03 15.	06 23 15	
Fenbendazole §205.603	FT	1999 TR Y	Combined with other paraciticides (Moxidectin and Ivermectin). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 04 20 15. TR suff due ASAP	05 19 15 Vote 06 02 15	
Ivermectin §205.603	FT	1999 TR Y	Combined with other paraciticides (Fendbendazole and Moxidectin). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 04 20 15. TR suff due ASAP	05 19 15 Vote 06 02 15	
Moxidectin §205.603	FT	2003 TR Y	Combined with other paraciticides (Fendbendazole and Ivermectin). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 04 20 15. TR suff due ASAP	05 19 15 Vote 06 02 15	
Hydrated lime §205.603(b)	TF	1995 TAP	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 03 27 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 07 15	06 23 15	
Hydrogen peroxide §205.603(a)	CW	Y (for Crops 205.601(a))	TR for Crops expected Jan/Feb 2015	06 16 15	
Iodine 205.603(a)(14) and 205.603(b)(2)	JR	1994 TAP <a href="#">2015 TR</a>	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 01 07 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found sufficient 01 20 15	06 23 15	
Mineral oil §205.603	PD	2002 TR <a href="#">2015 TR</a>	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	08 18 15	
Vitamins §205.603(d)	CW	<a href="#">2015 Lmtd scope</a>	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	06 02 15	

**2017 Sunsets (No TRs) Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015**

Substance	Contact	New TR reqst?	Notes	Discussion scheduled	Meeting
Aspirin §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		05 19 15	Review: Fall 2015
Atropine §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		08 18 15	
Butorphanol §205.603	CBo	2002 TR Y	New TR requested. Not contracted.	06 23 15	
Chlorine Mtrls: Calcium hypochlorite §205.603	FT	N (06 17)		07 21 15	
EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern §205.603	TF	N (06 03)	TR for NPEs sent to CS 01 30 15. No action by LS needed.	05 26 15	

Flunixin §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		08 18 15	
Formic Acid §205.603	CBo	N (06 17)		07 07 15	
Furosemide §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		08 18 15	
Glucose §205.603	CW	N (07 01)		06 16 15	
Glycerine §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		05 26 15	
Lidocaine §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		05 19 15	
Magnesium hydroxide §205.603	TF	N		08 25 15	
Magnesium sulfate §205.603	TF	N		08 25 15	
Methionine §205.603	TF	N		06 02 15	
Oxytocin §205.603	CW	N (07 01)		08 04 15	
Peracetic acid §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		08 18 15	
Phosphoric acid §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		05 26 15	
Poloxalene §205.603	FT	N		06 16 15	
Procaine §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		05 19 15	
Strychnine 205.604	JR	N (04 01)		05 26 15	
Sucrose octanoate esters §205.603	FT	N		06 16 15	
Trace minerals §205.603	FT	N		06 23 15	
Vaccines §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		05 26 15	
Tolazoline §205.603	FT	2002 TR Y	New TR requested. Not contracted.	08 04 15	
Xylazine §205.603	CBo	2002 TR Y	New TR requested. Not contracted.	08 04 15	

### Other projects

Project	Contact	TR Reqst?	Notes	Vote	Meeting

\* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed \*Highlight indicates review completion

## Agenda

- Approve notes from June 2, 2015
- 2017 sunsets - (FT) Review and vote: Chlorhexidine, Poloxalene, Sucrose octanoate esters
- 2017 sunsets - (CW) Review and vote: Glucose, Hydrogen peroxide, Isopropanol
- Adjourn

## Discussion

- **Notes from the June 2, 2015** approved with no changes.
- **2017 sunsets - (FT)**
  - **Chlorhexidine.** Both the lead and the LS chair summarized the material. Public comment was mixed and the LS received no answers to the question about use.

Motion to remove Chlorhexidine from §205.603(a)

Motion by: FT

Seconded by: CW

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **Poloxalene.** Poloxalene is a fast-acting synthetic material approved for emergency treatment of bloat. The LS received few comments, which were mixed. One commenter indicated that vegetable oil can be used as an alternative, and if vegetable oil didn't work, the next step would be surgery. The LS Chair noted that bloat is a serious problem and can cause death, and therefore recommends that Poloxalene remain on the list as an alternative.

Motion to remove Poloxalene from §205.603(a)

Motion by: FT

Seconded by: CBo

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 1 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **Sucrose octanoate esters (SOE).** SOE is an EPA-registered biopesticide used as an insecticide to control insects, including mites, on honey bees. Fairly benign and biodegrade rapidly. The LS received few comments, and those that were received were supportive.

Motion to remove Sucrose octanoate esters from § §205.603(b)

Motion by: FT

Seconded by: JR

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **2017 sunsets - (CW)**
  - **Glucose.** The lead summarized the material and noted that for the review he used the 1995 TAP review, 2015 public comments and previous NOSB recommendations. Glucose, which is a sugar, was added to the list as synthetic. The NOP noted that there is

an OFPA exemption for medical treatments. Glucose is used in the treatment of ketosis in livestock, and is essential. Commenters were overwhelming supportive of relisting.

Motion to remove Glucose from §205.603(a)

Motion by: CW

Seconded by: JR

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: Absent: 2 Recuse:

- **Hydrogen peroxide.** Used as a disinfectant. The lead looked at previous NOSB recommendations and public comment. A large spectrum of stakeholders support relisting.

Motion to remove Hydrogen peroxide from §205.603(a)

Motion by: CW

Seconded by: JR

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **Isopropanol.** The lead summarized the material and noted that for the review he used the previous TAP review, public comments and NOSB recommendations. Isopropanol is widely used and needed. Public commenters were supportive of relisting.

Motion to remove Isopropanol from §205.603

Motion by: CW

Seconded by: JR

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **The meeting was adjourned**

## [Previous LS Notes](#)

### **Future Call Schedule:**

#### **June 2, 2015**

Acid-Activated Bentonite - TR sufficiency

2017 sunsets - (FT) Review and vote on 4 proposals (finish parasiticides, + 3)

2017 sunsets - (CW) Vitamins

2017 sunsets - (TF) MET

Discuss proposals for annotation changes

#### **June 16, 2015**

2017 sunsets - (FT) Review and vote on 3 reviews (Chlorhexidine, Poloxalene, Sucrose octanoate esters)

2017 sunsets - (CW) Glucose, Hydrogen peroxide, Isopropanol

#### **June 23, 2015 - additional call**

Aluminum Sulfate (JR) - TR sufficiency

Acid activated bentonite (AS) - Determine need for TR

Iodine (JR) - Discuss proposal & vote



Excipients (JR) - Discuss proposal & vote  
 Hydrated Lime (TF) - Discuss proposal & vote  
 Trace minerals (TF) - Discuss proposal & vote  
 Butorphanol (CBo) - Discuss proposal & vote

**July 7, 2015**

**July 21, 2015**

**July 28, 2015 - additional call**

**August 4, 2015**

**August 18, 2015**

Atropine, mineral oil (PD)

Flunixin and Furosemide (AS)

**August 25, 2015 - additional call**

**September 1, 2015**

**September 15, 2015**

**October 6, 2015**

**October 20, 2015**

**November 3, 2015**

**November 17, 2015**

**December 1, 2015**

**December 15, 2015**

Fall 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOP - Complete Fall 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	July 8, 2015
Request for TRs for 2018 sunset materials	July 15, 2015
NOSB - Fall 2015 proposals due to NOP	Aug 26, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 8, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Sep 11, 2015
Public comment closes	Oct 5, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Oct 8, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 13, 2015
Fall 2015 NOSB meeting - Stowe, VT	Oct 26 - 29, 2015

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting Notes  
Tuesday, June 23, 2015 3:00pm ET**

**Attending:** Tracy Favre, Chair (TF); Jean Richardson (JR); Ashley Swaffar (AS), Co-VC; Francis Thicke (FT); Colehour Bondera (CBo)

**Absent:** Paula Daniels (PD); Calvin Walker, Vice Chair (CW); Mac Stone (MS)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

**Work Agenda**

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Vote	Meeting
<a href="#">Aluminum Sulfate (PDF)</a>	205.603	JR	2015	The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TRs (2) sent to LS 05 15 15. Suff due 07 15 15. TR found suff 06 23 15		Proposal Fall 2015
<a href="#">Sodium Bisulfate</a>	205.603	JR	<a href="#">2015</a>	Petition sent to LS 05 27 14. Q's for petitioner/TR request due 07 28 14. TR request sent to NOP 08 06 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TR sent to LS 05 14 15. Suff due 07 14 15. TR found suff 05 19 15		TBD
<a href="#">Acid-Activated Bentonite</a>	205.603	AS	Y Lmtd Scope	Petition sent to LS 04 03 15. Q's for petitioner. TR request due 06 02 15. Petition found suff 06 02 15. Determine need for TR. Rqst for Lmtd scope TR sent 06 23 15  Two related petitions pending for treatment of poultry litter: <b>sodium bisulfate</b> and <b>aluminum sulfate</b> . <a href="#">TAP for Kaolin Clay and Bentonite 1995</a>		TBD

<a href="#">Aquaculture-CO<sub>2</sub></a> , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqtst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Chlorine</a> (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	<a href="#">2011 Crops TR</a> <a href="#">2006 TR</a> <a href="#">1995 TAP</a>	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Micronutrients</a> (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	<a href="#">2010 TR (Nickel)</a> <a href="#">6/2013 Minerals TR</a>	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants)</a> (for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	<a href="#">2/2011 Crops TR</a> <a href="#">7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR</a>	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture-Vitamins (B1, B12, H)</a> for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	<a href="#">4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR</a>	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals</a>	205.611	JR	<a href="#">2011 TR</a> (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD

<a href="#">Aquaculture - Chlorine</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	No <a href="#">Crops 2011</a> <a href="#">Crops 2006</a> <a href="#">Crops 1995</a> <a href="#">Livestock 2006</a> <a href="#">Handling 2006</a>	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture – Tocopherols</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	<a href="#">2013 TR</a> <a href="#">1995 TAP</a> <a href="#">rvw</a>	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture – Vitamins</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes <a href="#">2013 TR</a>	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with Minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
<a href="#">Aquaculture - Trace Minerals</a> (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	<a href="#">2013 TR</a>	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

2017 Sunsets TR Requests Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015					
Substance	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Discussion scheduled:	Meeting
Ethanol §205.603	TF	Y	Draft TR sent to LS 09 24 14. Suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 01 06 15	08 18 15	Review: Fall 2015
Isopropanol §205.603	CW	Y	Draft TR sent to LS 09 24 14. Suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 01 06 15	06 16 16	
Chlorhexidine §205.603	FT/CW	2010 TR Y	TR requested 08 15 14. TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 02 26 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 03 15.	06 16 15	
Copper sulfate §205.603	TF	1995 TAP <a href="#">2015 Lmtd Scope</a>	TR in development (expected Dec 2014). TR sent to LS 02 13 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	05 26 15	

Electrolytes §205.603	CW	1995 TAP 2015 TR	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 03 27 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 07 15	08 04 15	
Excipients §205.603	JR	Y	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 02 26 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 03 15.	06 23 15	
Fenbendazole §205.603	FT	1999 TR Y	Combined with other paraciticides (Moxidectin and Ivermectin). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 04 20 15. TR suff due ASAP	05 19 15 Vote 06 02 15	
Ivermectin §205.603	FT	1999 TR Y	Combined with other paraciticides (Fendbendazole and Moxidectin). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 04 20 15. TR suff due ASAP	05 19 15 Vote 06 02 15	
Moxidectin §205.603	FT	2003 TR Y	Combined with other paraciticides (Fendbendazole and Ivermectin). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 04 20 15. TR suff due ASAP	05 19 15 Vote 06 02 15	
Hydrated lime §205.603(b)	TF	1995 TAP	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 03 27 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 07 15	06 23 15	
Hydrogen peroxide §205.603(a)	CW	Y (for Crops 205.601(a))	TR for Crops expected Jan/Feb 2015	06 16 15	
Iodine 205.603(a)(14) and 205.603(b)(2)	JR	1994 TAP <a href="#">2015 TR</a>	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to LS 01 07 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found sufficient 01 20 15	06 23 15	
Mineral oil §205.603	PD	2002 TR <a href="#">2015 TR</a>	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	08 18 15	
Vitamins §205.603(d)	CW	<a href="#">2015 Lmtd scope</a>	TR expected Jan/Feb 2015	06 02 15	

### 2017 Sunsets (No TRs) Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015

Substance	Contact	New TR reqst?	Notes	Discussion scheduled	Meeting
Aspirin §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		05 19 15	Review: Fall 2015
Atropine §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		08 18 15	
Butorphanol §205.603	CBo	2002 TR Y	New TR requested. Not contracted.	07 07 15	
Chlorine Mtrls: Calcium hypochlorite §205.603	FT	N (06 17)		07 21 15	
EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern §205.603	TF	N (06 03)	TR for NPEs sent to CS 01 30 15. No action by LS needed.	05 26 15	

Flunixin §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		08 18 15	
Formic Acid §205.603	CBo	N (06 17)		07 07 15	
Furosemide §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		08 18 15	
Glucose §205.603	CW	N (07 01)		06 16 15	
Glycerine §205.603	TF	N (06 03)		05 26 15	
Lidocaine §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		05 19 15	
Magnesium hydroxide §205.603	TF	N		08 25 15	
Magnesium sulfate §205.603	TF	N		08 25 15	
Methionine §205.603	TF	N		06 02 15	
Oxytocin §205.603	CW	N (07 01)		08 04 15	
Peracetic acid §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		08 18 15	
Phosphoric acid §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		05 26 15	
Poloxalene §205.603	FT	N		06 16 15	
Procaine §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		05 19 15	
Strychnine 205.604	JR	N (04 01)		05 26 15	
Sucrose octanoate esters §205.603	FT	N		06 16 15	
Trace minerals §205.603	FT	N		06 23 15	
Vaccines §205.603	JR	N (04 01)		05 26 15	
Tolazoline §205.603	FT	2002 TR Y	New TR requested. Not contracted.	08 04 15	
Xylazine §205.603	CBo	2002 TR Y	New TR requested. Not contracted.	08 04 15	

### Other projects

Project	Contact	TR Reqst?	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Annotation Changes NPEs Trace Minerals Procaine			Will be discussed at ES meeting 7-10-15		

Lidocaine					
-----------	--	--	--	--	--

\* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed \*Highlight indicates review completion

### Agenda

- Approve notes from June 16, 2015
- Aluminum Sulfate (JR) - TR sufficiency
- Acid activated bentonite (AS) - Determine need for TR
- Iodine (JR) - Discuss proposal & vote
- Excipients (JR) - Discuss proposal & vote
- Hydrated Lime (TF) - Discuss proposal & vote
- Trace minerals (TF) - Discuss proposal & vote
- Butorphanol (CBo) - Discuss proposal & vote
- Adjourn

### Discussion

- **Notes from the June 16, 2015** call were approved with no changes.
- **Aluminum Sulfate (JR) - TR sufficiency.** The LS found TR sufficient and will notify the NOP of such.
- **Acid activated bentonite (AS).** Used as a litter amendment. The lead opened a discussion about how to proceed given that there are three other materials used in litter management currently under review. The members discussed this and chose to request a limited scope TR. The lead will pose questions to include in the TR and send them to the LS Chair to forward to the NOP.
- **Iodine (JR).** The lead noted that the LS has already discussed this material. Iodine is a critical substance and has many uses, including teat dips. The group discussed the efforts by the dairy industry to remove Nonylphenol ethoxylates (NPEs) from teat dips, and the lead indicated that she has already seen labels that say "NPE free". The LS proposes to leave iodine on the list at this time.

Motion to remove iodine from 205.603(a)(14) and 205.603(b)(2)

Motion by: JR

Seconded by: HA

Additional Discussion: A member asked if they should consider an annotation change as they have language in the review regarding that. Since the industry is currently addressing this, both the NOP and several LS members discussed revisiting the idea of an annotation change at the next NOSB meeting. The lead agreed to adjust language to indicate LS is planning to address an annotation change in the future.

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **Excipients (JR).** The lead summarized the material and difficulties associated with this review. There are approximately 8000 substances that may qualify as permitted excipients, and there isn't a comprehensive list. Most chemicals used as excipients in organic livestock production are identified in the FDA's EAFUS: Food Additive Database, and are considered Generally Regarded as Safe (GRAS). Public commenters were supportive of the relisting of excipients.

Motion to remove Excipients from 205.603(f)

Motion by: JR

Seconded by: CW

Additional Discussion: The lead clarified for one of the members that the NOSB didn't receive much feedback, and the comments they received were supportive of relisting..

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **Hydrated Lime (TF).** The group discussed the draft review. The lead noted that Hydrated lime has various uses, the NOSB received few comments but the comments were very useful, and the commenters were in support of relisting.

Motion to remove Hydrated Lime from §205.603(b)

Motion by: TF

Seconded by: CW

Additional Discussion: The group discussed application of hydrated lime for sheep mange and foot rot. A member questioned the impact on soil, but hydrated lime is considered a synthetic soil amendment and is not allowed for that use. .

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **Trace minerals (TF)** - Trace minerals are important for the maintenance, growth, and reproduction in the healthy production of beef cattle, swine, and poultry. Public comment was overwhelmingly supportive of leaving trace minerals on the list.

Motion to remove trace minerals from §205.603(e)

Motion by: TF

Seconded by: JR/CW

Additional Discussion: A member noted that some of the minerals included in this list are in fact macro minerals and not trace (or micro) minerals. The NOP directed attention to the guidance on minerals, which is more descriptive and explicit. The members made some minor changes to the review document to clarify this.

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **Butorphanol (CBo).** Discussion and vote. Deferred to next call.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

## [Previous LS Notes](#)

### **Future Call Schedule:**

#### **June 16, 2015**

2017 sunsets - (FT) Review and vote on 3 reviews (Chlorhexidine, Poloxalene, Sucrose octanoate esters)

2017 sunsets - (CW) Glucose, Hydrogen peroxide, Isopropanol

#### **June 23, 2015 - additional call**

Aluminum Sulfate (JR) - TR sufficiency

Acid activated bentonite (AS) - Determine need for TR

Iodine (JR) - Discuss proposal & vote

Excipients (JR) - Discuss proposal & vote

Hydrated Lime (TF) - Discuss proposal & vote

Trace minerals (TF) - Discuss proposal & vote



Butorphanol (CBo) - Discuss proposal & vote  
**July 7, 2015**

Butorphanol (CBo) - Discuss proposal & vote  
Formic Acid (CBo) - Discuss proposal & vote

**July 21, 2015**

**July 28, 2015 - additional call**

**August 4, 2015**

**August 18, 2015**

Atropine, mineral oil (PD)

Flunixin and Furosemide (AS)

**August 25, 2015 - additional call**

**September 1, 2015**

**September 15, 2015**

**October 6, 2015**

**October 20, 2015**

**November 3, 2015**

**November 17, 2015**

**December 1, 2015**

**December 15, 2015**

<b>Fall 2015 Milestones</b>	<b>Target date</b>
NOP - Complete Fall 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	July 8, 2015
Request for TRs for 2018 sunset materials	July 15, 2015
NOSB - Fall 2015 proposals due to NOP	Aug 26, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 8, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Sep 11, 2015
Public comment closes	Oct 5, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Oct 8, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 13, 2015
Fall 2015 NOSB meeting - Stowe, VT	Oct 26 - 29, 2015